University of Fort Hare

Together in Excellence

Student Grievances at Institutions of Higher Education and Training in Post-Apartheid South Africa: A Case Study of the Fees Must Fall Movement at the University of Fort Hare in East London.

by

Zandile Y. Fazzie

(Student Number: 201508986)

Mini-dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Master of Social Science degree in African Studies in the Faculty of Social Sciences and Humanities at the University of Fort Hare.

Supervisor: Dr O. Sibanda

2018

East London Campus

DECLARATION

I, Zandile Yolisa Fazzie, declare that 'Student Grievances at Institutions of Higher Education and Training in Post-Apartheid South Africa: A Case Study of the Fees Must Fall Movement at the University of Fort Hare in East London' is my own work and that it has not been submitted for any other degree or examination at this or any other university, and that all the resources I have used or quoted have been acknowledged by means of complete references.

Signature .....

Date 12/04/2018

DEDICATION

This mini-dissertation is dedicated to my late parents who I consider to be my guardian angels, ***Zukile Vusumzi Fazzie*** and ***Nomfundo Monica Fazzie***.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would love to thank the following people who each played different roles in ensuring that this mini-dissertation came into fruition:

Firstly, I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr O. Sibanda, for her never wavering support, guidance and encouragement. Secondly, I would like to thank Mr F. Sibanda, Dr T. Connor, Ms A. Mjekula, Mr Z. Sita and other staff members at Fort Hare Institute of Social and Economic Research (FHISER) who were always willing to assist me with any questions or queries that I had. Thirdly, I would like to thank my classmates who offered invaluable inputs and support towards my mini-dissertation and with whom I had the honour of working closely. Fourthly, I would like to thank everyone who agreed to participate in my study and gave me valuable knowledge as well as every single person who contributed directly or indirectly to my study. Lastly, I would like to extend my humble gratitude to my family and friends who encouraged me to see my mini-dissertation through.

ABSTRACT

This study investigates student grievances at institutions of higher education and training in post-apartheid South Africa, using as a case study the Fees Must Fall movement at the University of Fort Hare in East London. The key challenge which was found in this study is the fact that South African tertiary institutions are not accessible and affordable to everyone because they are expensive and generally demand a lot of financial input. The Fees Must Fall movement hence encompasses a whole variety of socio-political and economic issues and is not based solely on the issue of fees. This study adopted the qualitative research paradigm approach to gather data through interviews and observations. The study revealed that tertiary institutions are underfunded and not in a position to effectively cater for students' needs. The study recommends the strengthening or formation of a partnership between the University of Fort Hare and businesses in order to form a mutually beneficial relationship that will see the University of Fort Hare getting funding and the businesses getting skilled labour.

Table of Contents

DECLARATION ii
DEDICATION iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS iv
ABSTRACT v
LIST OF FIGURES ix
LIST OF PHOTOS x
LIST OF ACRONYMS xi
CHAPTER ONE 1
Overview of the Study 1
1.1 Introduction 1
1.2 Research Problem 2
1.3 Research Questions 3
1.4 Research Objectives 3
1.5 Significance of the Study 3
1.6 Limitations of the Study 4
1.7 Delimitations of the Study 4
1.8 Chapter Outline 4
CHAPTER TWO 6
Literature Review and Theoretical Framework 6
2.1 Introduction 6
2.2 Theoretical Framework 6
2.3 Brief History of Fort Hare and the Nature and Culture of Protesting in South Africa 10
2.4 Fees Must Fall Movement at the University of Fort Hare in East London 14
2.5 Conclusion 20
CHAPTER THREE 21
Research Methodology 21
3.1 Introduction 21
3.2 Research Approach 21
3.3 Research Design 22
3.4 Population Sampling/Sampling 22
3.4.1 Population 22
3.4.2 Sampling 23
3.5 Research Instruments 23
3.5.1 Interviews 23
3.5.2 Observation 23

3.6 Data Presentation and Analysis 24
3.7 Location of the Study 24
3.8 Ethical Considerations 25
3.9 Conclusion 26
CHAPTER FOUR 27
Data Presentation and Analysis 27
4.1 Introduction 27
4.2 Students' Understanding of the Fees Must Fall Movement 27
4.3 Students' Perspective on the State of Funding and Student debt at the University of Fort Hare 30
4.4 Students' Perspectives on the University of Fort Hare Residences and Whether or Not they Reside in the Residences 32
4.5 Students' Perspectives on What They Do To Socialize and Whether or Not Fort Hare Residences Offers a Platform For Students to Socialize 34
4.6 Students' Perspectives on Sport and Recreation at the University of Fort Hare 37
4.7 Students' Perspectives on the Crime Rate in the City of East London 39
4.8 Students' Perspectives on the Academic Facilities of the University of Fort Hare 41
4.9 Students' Perception of the City of East London 43
4.10 University of Fort Hare Management/Staff on the Fees Must Fall Movement at Fort Hare 46
4.11 Conclusion 49
CHAPTER FIVE 50
Presenting of Research Findings 50
5.1 Introduction 50
5.2 Beyond Fees: Other Grievances 50
5.3 Indebted Students and the Right to Education 51
5.4 The Promise and Expectations: Free Education? 53
5.5 Commission Findings on the University of Fort Hare 56
5.6 The Threat of Crime and Lack of Recreational facilities in East London 58
5.7 Conclusion 59
CHAPTER SIX 60
Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations 60
6.1 Summary 60
6.2 Conclusions 60
6.3 Recommendations 61
REFERENCES 63
APPENDICES 67

Appendix 1 - Interview Guide for University of Fort Hare Students 67
Appendix 2 - Interview Guide for Members of the University of Fort Hare Student Representative Council 69
Appendix 3 – Interview Guide for University of Fort Hare Management/Staff 70
Appendix 4 - Ethical Clearance Certificate 71

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. 1. Extract from the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training 57

LIST OF PHOTOS

Picture 1. 1 University of Fort Hare in the Early 1900s 10
Picture 1. 2 University of Fort Hare Students Marching in Solidarity 12
Picture 1. 3 University of Fort Hare Students Marching During a National Shutdown Day 13
Picture 1. 4 Students Protesting in Quigney, East London 15
Picture 1. 5 Heavy Police Presence on the University of Fort Hare East London Campus 18

LIST OF ACRONYMS

ANC – African National Congress

CBD – Central Business District

DA – Democratic Alliance

DHE – Department of Higher Education

FHISER – Fort Hare Institute of Social and Economic Research

GDP – Gross Domestic Product

HAI – Historically Advantaged Institution

HDI – Historically Disadvantaged Institution

HR – Human Resources

MTEF – Medium Term Expenditure Framework

NSFAS – National Student Financial Aid Scheme

SAPS – South African Police Service

SAUS - South African Union of Students

SRC – Student Representative Council

UFH – University of Fort Hare

UKZN – University of KwaZulu Natal

WI-FI – Wireless Fidelity

CHAPTER ONE

Overview of the Study

1.1 Introduction

Universities play a fundamental role in producing intellectual human capital critical to the industry that sustains cities. Benneworth (2010:1) states that: "universities are important players in the global development of knowledge economy, alongside being significant contributors to the economic development of their host cities. They are both significant knowledge enterprises and the suppliers of the human and intellectual capital on which the knowledge-based economy depends".

July (1987) as cited in Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2016:57) states that: 'the first universities in black Africa were imports, their purpose the indoctrination of a foreign culture". According to Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2016) it was necessary to include the following initiatives in order to reverse alienation: revive indigenous African language, rise of nationalist historiography and the reaffirmation of African identities.

According to Cloete (2016) South Africa desperately needs strong tertiary education institutions. The issue is therefore not feasibility, but whether South Africa wants to adopt another self-destructive policy that will widen inequality and privilege the deracialising rich. Like the rest of Africa, South Africa has one of the most unequal and inefficient school systems on the continent. Installing a free university system on top of that will only serve to solidify and expand inequality. Being one of the most unequal societies in the world, South Africa has an economy that is not growing. Higher education is a social mobility mechanism. Maintaining and building strong universities needs a combination of two things: better government funding and fee income with affordability funding support for the poor and the lower middle class (Cloete, 2016).

Masila (2016) argues that the Fees Must Fall movement has a bigger picture than one might think. Masila (2016) further asserts that the Fees Must Fall movement's ideals are a form of relief for both students and parents because higher education has become a goal which has proved very difficult to attain. It has given publicity to issues which have been plaguing them. The main pressing and concerning matter for students was the fact that many of them could not afford to pay their university debts and, to make things worse, the higher education institutions had planned to increase tuition fees (Masila, 2016).

According to Hall (2016) the university crisis has illustrated how history and race continue to permeate almost every aspect of South Africa's public life and how these issues still continue to be relevant in this day and age. Hall (2016) further notes that intense debates have taken place through the media and on campuses and this has opened a window on the anger and disillusionment of many black South Africans who were born after the Mandela-led settlement of the early 1990s. The main focus of student protests is the curriculum which in their view is unreformed and narrow as well as containing practices and cultures which put them in a position of feeling like outsiders and unwelcome in their own country and public universities (Hall, 2016).

1.2 Research Problem

According to Cloete, Maasen, Fehnel, Moja, Perold and Gibbon (2004) South African education at tertiary institutions has not transformed much since apartheid and there is a lack of transformation in education. To date, education still privileges a few and students believe that fees is one of the infrastructures put in place to make sure it discriminates the poor from the middle class (Cloete *et al.*, 2004). The research aims to elicit narratives of tertiary institutions and their financial challenges as well as to explore and investigate the Fees Must Fall movement at the University of Fort Hare (UFH) in East London. The study also investigates the long history of student activism at the University of Fort Hare. It seeks to bring to light as well student grievances which are underlying and not as well publicised as the main issue of fees and how institutions of higher education and training in post-apartheid South Africa are lacking and how they can be improved.

The Fees Must Fall movement encompasses a whole variety of economic and socio-political issues which are interrelated and is not focused solely on the issue of fees as one would assume looking at it at face value. The Fees Must Fall movement illustrated an incredible rise in solidarity which transcended past race and which saw students from different universities come together to fight for one common cause and put whatever differences they might have aside and invest all their energy in fighting to liberate and empower themselves through education.

This study plans to bring the plight of students to the fore in the hope of making their student experience much more pleasurable and to make sure their grievances are addressed. This study will also seek to dissect the core issues of the Fees Must Fall

movement to help better understand the student reasoning behind it. At the core of students' demands has been a demand for the right to recognition and the right to the services they are entitled to enjoy as paying students and citizens of the city of East London.

1.3 Research Questions

1. What are the possible causes of the Fees Must Fall protests in South African tertiary institution?

2. What role does financial challenges play in the Fees Must Fall movement?

3. What other grievances apart from fees do students raise in a South African tertiary institution?

1.4 Research Objectives

In order to elicit narratives regarding the challenges faced by students in South African tertiary institutions, the objectives of the study were:

1. To investigate the possible causes of the Fees Must Fall protests in a South African tertiary institution.

2. To determine the role of financial challenges in the Fees Must Fall movement.

3. To identify other grievances apart from fees that students raise in a South African tertiary institution.

1.5 Significance of the Study

This topic is significant in that it is a contentious issue that is gripping the country at the moment. This topic has generally been presented at face value usually in social media; as such this research hopes to provide more insight into the student thought process and what students feel they need and want.

The study will also investigate the long history of student activism at the University of Fort Hare and seek to bring to light student grievances which are underlying and not as well publicised as the main issue of fees, including how institutions of higher education and training in post-apartheid South Africa are lacking and how they can be improved.

1.6 Limitations of the Study

Time and finance will be limitations that one is expected to encounter in this study as they will restrict the researcher and won't allow a broader study as much as one would like. Because this is a mini-thesis the researcher focuses only on a local and not a national scale in the case study.

1.7 Delimitations of the Study

This study focuses only on the students at the University of Fort Hare in East London. Thus, the results are not generalizable to the broader population. Despite this, the aim of the study is to provide in-depth insight and not to generalize the findings.

1.8 Chapter Outline

Chapter One: Overview of the Study

Chapter one introduces the entire study and provides discussions of broad aspects of the study. This chapter provides an introduction and background, statement of the problem, aim of the study, research objectives and questions as well as the significance of the study.

Chapter Two: Literature Review and Theoretical Framework

Chapter two discusses theoretical framework literature relating to a brief history of Fort Hare as an institution, the culture of protesting in South Africa and the Fees Must Fall movement at the University of Fort Hare in East London.

Chapter Three: Research Methodology

Chapter three discusses all the methodological considerations for the study including the research approach, data collection and analysis strategies, sampling methods and ethical considerations, etc.

Chapter Four: Data Presentation and Analysis

Chapter four reports key findings from the primary data collection. The data will be presented together with existing literature to support the findings.

Chapter Five: Presenting of Research Findings

Chapter five will present all the research findings of this study.

Chapter Six: Summary, Recommendations and Conclusion

Chapter six provides the summary and conclusions of the study based on the research findings as well as the recommendations for further study.

CHAPTER TWO

Literature Review and Theoretical Framework

2.1 Introduction

This chapter focuses on literature that has been written by other scholars on the issue of student protests over fees, particularly the movement that drives this protest which is the Fees Must Fall movement. Gaps in literature available have been identified and steps/strategies to fill these gaps have been explained. The theoretical framework that guides this study has also been explained in detail. This study pursues ideological and political theory that is proposed by Saleem Badat (2016).

2.2 Theoretical Framework

The study was framed by using two theories, namely: the political and ideological theory. The political theory is relevant in the context of the Fees Must Fall movement in the sense that the University of Fort Hare has always been a place where active political protests and calls for change have occurred. Students at the University of Fort Hare have always seen themselves as agents of change who tackle the sensitive issue of transformation in the country which has taken a long time to come into fruition. Universities such as Fort Hare were discriminated against in the past and students have become awakened to the fact that they are disadvantaged in many ways in terms of the insufficient infrastructure and accommodation; students' safety and security and lack of ability for them to pay their fees as the majority are born into poor families. The Student Representative Councils (SRC) are political formations which are aligned to political parties so when demonstrations take place these student leaders do so to drive a political agenda of transforming the university and making it accessible to everyone, even the poorest of the poor.

The ideological theory is relevant in the context of the Fees Must Fall movement in the sense that the University of Fort Hare gave birth to many top political figures in Africa and is not only an ordinary university but ideologically it is seen as a site for struggle and a site for students to assert their rights. Fort Hare is not only a university but it also represents a site of struggle as students of today feel that they have the power to change and transform things as a collective student body by pressurising university management to adopt the changes they want in order for their university lives to improve.

Both theories apply to this study because of their focus on ideology that informs and shapes student socio-political activism at the University of Fort Hare. Students have always seen themselves as central to political issues which aim to push for transformation. Hence, political theory explains how students respond to the politics of exclusion and differentiation at Institutions of Higher Education and Training.

Badat (2016) notes that student protests plague historically black universities and protests have become their outlet to shape and steer higher education to address their needs.

Badat (2016:8) further adds that:

> Higher education holds the promise of contributing to social injustice, economic and social development and democratic citizenship. Yet this promise often remains unrealised and higher education instead becomes a powerful mechanism of social exclusion and injustice. The reason is that education, of course, is not an autonomous social force. It is a necessary condition of positive social transformation but not a sufficient condition. For education to become more equitable and contribute effectively to social justice in South Africa there have to be bold and purposeful social justice-oriented policies and initiatives in other arenas of society.

Economic policies of the post-1994 ANC government have not laid the basis for "fundamentally addressing inequality even if there have been some pro-poor social policies geared towards addressing certain dimensions of poverty" (Badat, 2016:9). "Institutional change in post-1994 South African higher education has occurred in an epoch of globalisation and in conjuncture of the dominance of the ideology of neo-liberalism" (Badat, 2016:6).

Harvey (2005:2) states that neoliberalism is "a theory of political economic practices that purpose that human well-being can best be advanced by liberating individual entrepreneurial freedoms and skills within an institutional framework characterised by strong private property rights, free markets and free trade". Berdahl (as cited in Badat, 2016:6) on the other hand argues that "the logic of the market has defined the purposes of universities largely in terms of their role in economic development".

According to Badat (2016:6-7) "public investment in higher education has come to be largely justified in terms of economic growth and preparing students for the labour market. The notion of higher education as a tradable service and a private good that

primarily benefits students has influenced public financing which in turn has impacted on the structure and nature of higher education".

Nayyar (as cited in Badat, 2016:7) argues that "at one end, the commercialisation of universities means business in education. At the other end, the entry of private players in higher education means education as business". Duderstadt, Taggart and Weber (2008:275) state that technological revolution and market forces are the main drivers of globalisation and that globalisation is "exercising an influence on the nature of institutions that impact higher education" and on the "ways and means of providing higher education". These considerations are "shaping education both in terms of what is taught and what is researched and is shifting both student interests and university offerings away from broader academic studies and towards narrower vocational programmes".

According to Badat (2016) higher education is conditioned by wider social and economic policies and these have been major constraints on the pursuit of ambitious transformation goals. Transformation has not been achieved because of critical issues such as "decolonisation, deracialisation, degendering and demasculanisation of the academic and institutional structures and cultures of universities" (Badat, 2016:7).

Badat (2016:8) argues the following:

> It is not that prior to the student protests there had not been critical voices that had raised issues of curriculum and the like, but that they have gained little traction at universities and in higher education and have remained largely marginal concerns. It is also not the case that there has been either a uniform unwillingness or no efforts to tackle colonial, racist, patriarchal discourses and the culture of whiteness. The reality is that for reasons that are important to understand, initiatives to date have yet to succeed in uprooting inherited cultures and practices and bringing about the far-reaching transformations that are necessary and long overdue.

Badat (2016:9) states that "politically in terms of social policy, a developmental and democratic state committed to a better life for all and that extends and deepens popular participation in the economic, political and social domains has failed to materialise".

According to Badat (2016:9) "South Africa's failings are neither entirely technocratic nor managerial. They are political, associated with a government that is increasingly mired in short-term electoral politics, fails to distinguish between party and state, is

incapable of acting decisively against corruption and lacks the will to act courageously and decisively to address problems at the levels of policy, personnel and performance in a context in which the apartheid legacy remains intractably entrenched in various arenas".

Badat (2016:9) notes that mass political opposition from black students in black universities was widespread as they were frustrated at the possibility of them "being condemned to a future of limited socioeconomic opportunities, indignity and inequality". Badat (2016) further goes on to state that black academic institutions provided an ideal environment for developing their aspirations and shared grievances.

Du Toit in Badat (2016:10) states that: "on top of the insecurity associated with available funds for tuition, accommodation, academic materials and subsistence, add the prospect of large debt, high drop-out rates, poor throughput rates, inadequate facilities and accommodation, largely questionable quality of learning and teaching to ensure meaningful opportunities and success and alienating and disempowering academic and institutional cultures that are suffused by whiteness and are products of the historical legacies of intellectual colonisation and racialisation".

According to Badat (2016) those who come from disadvantaged backgrounds and are black tend to experience the historically white universities' cultures and environments as disempowering, discomforting, exclusionary and alienating. "Consistent, concerted, comprehensive, diligent and sustained efforts to change what exists, to forge new inclusive cultures and build universities that genuinely include all have been either lacking for one or other reason or have failed to yield results" (Badat, 2016:10, 11).

Students have exercised the ability to hold their government to account through various protests and demonstrations as they envisioned a materially better life for themselves. The ideology of neoliberalism allows a tiny minority of elites to exercise real political power to the exclusion of the vast majority of humanity. The rich are getting richer while the poor are getting poorer. Poverty and economic suffering of the majority of South Africans is not accidental or a product of corruption alone but is due to a deliberately maintained system of neoliberalism that allows a few to control

most of the wealth and power and forces the majority of the people to be subservient wage slaves to them.

Since the end of apartheid, decisions which have been taken by government have rather entrenched inequalities. The academic playing fields were hoped to be levelled post-1994 in the hopes of improving historically black universities' research and graduate output and give them access to better infrastructure and systems, but the merger of historically white and historically black universities and technikons have deepened inequality and the cries of students at historically black, disadvantaged universities are ignored while their middle-class counterparts garner so much attention.

Students at poorer institutions that cater almost exclusively for black students such as Fort Hare University have been protesting routinely against rising fees and the cost of higher education since 1994.

2.3 Brief History of Fort Hare and the Nature and Culture of Protesting in South Africa

On the 8th of February 1916 the South African Native College opened in Alice, launching a university that "would alter the future of South Africa" (Massey, 2010:13). Fort Hare has been in existence since 1916 and has grown into a burgeoning home for black intellectuals (Massey, 2010). In 1952 the South African Native College changed its name to the University College of Fort Hare (Massey, 2010).

Picture 1. 1 University of Fort Hare in the Early 1900s

Source: Mail and Guardian (07/03/2014).

Zuma (2016) states that Fort Hare is a very important heritage institution not only for South Africa but also the African continent as a whole. According to Zuma (2016) the liberation and education of the African continent was achieved through struggle at this special site. Tandwa (2016) also argues that Fort Hare is where many black students ignited their political activism and political awakening.

Fort Hare's significance goes well beyond its ability to produce individuals who fought for and spearheaded South Africa's liberation. Much of what has taken place in the liberation struggle in South Africa is an intricate piece of history that parallels the history of the University of Fort Hare (Massey, 2010). "Fort Hare's story is indeed vital in gaining a comprehensive picture of modern South African history. From its inception, Fort Hare was a microcosm of political life in South Africa" (Massey, 2010:16).

While Fort Hare is an institution with a rich history one can note that historically black institutions such as Fort Hare are still competing for resources with their white counterparts. Historically disadvantaged black universities have seen their student enrolments decline. Students have rather opted to enrol in historically advantaged white institutions which are better resourced. This alone widens and entrenches past inequalities as lower student enrolment means less money as "governments funding formula subsidies institutions according to student enrolments, graduation rates and recognised or accredited research publications" (Davids and Waghid, 2016). This is unfortunately why the University of Fort Hare has not improved much since its existence and why it is still plagued by the same student issues which have been bothering students since it came into existence.

According to Hall (2016) colonialism and apartheid are part of the root causes of the student uprisings in South Africa and the main branches which stem from that are issues of fees, race, identity and unemployment which are provoking students across the country. "Underlying youth anger are the legacies of racial discrimination and colonialism, high levels of unemployment and pronounced and increasing income inequality (Hall, 2016). Protests have escalated and are likely to continue because they are rooted in difficult economic realities that cannot be resolved within the current model of student funding" (Hall, 2016).

Picture 1. 2 University of Fort Hare Students Marching in Solidarity

Source: Daily Dispatch (22/10/2015).

Branch & Mampilly (2015) state that Africa needs to look extensively into its own past and own history of protest before focusing on the events which are taking place in the rest of the world in order to explain the current continental protest wave.

Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2016: 55) characterised the existing protest politics into three broad waves: the first and second wave of protests were undertaken by detribalised Africans and workers who were fighting to be included in the political economy. The third wave of protests is being undertaken by students who are rejecting the neoliberal economies, who are tired of poor service delivery, lack of accountability and the use of violence by the state. Brown as cited in Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2016:55) states that an insurgent citizen has emerged from South Africa's political order which is riddled with fractures and cracks. The dream of a post-apartheid rainbow nation collapsed and left many disillusioned and at the core of this existing society today is inequality.

An agenda on key issues was forcefully placed by the students through their protest action and this served as a dramatic reminder of "the unfinished business in higher

education" (Badat, 2016:19). Students have discovered that they can wield power through collective action and mobilisation.

Picture 1. 3 University of Fort Hare Students Marching during a National Shutdown Day

Source: Daily Dispatch (23/10/2015).

A site of struggle for students is the university, the westernised modern university which emerged in Africa by being uprooted from Europe (Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2016). "The existing universities in Africa did not grow from the African seed and are not a product of deliberate and slow growth from the African socio-cultural and politico-economic developments" (Pratt, 1965 cited in Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2016:57).

According to Badat (2016:17) "the student movement overall and at each university was very unlikely to be homogenous, movements hardly ever are. Unlike organisations where the basis of affiliation is ideological, political, and cultural and so forth and which tend to have a more unitary character, movements tend to be constituted by a variety and diversity of ideologies, political affiliations and concerns. The Fees Must Fall movement is a broad and dynamic entity which includes individual students who are not formally attached to organisations and whose size and boundaries are likely to vary depending on economic circumstances, political and academic conditions, time of year and issues being confronted".

Morken (2015) states that: "one of the signs of a looming revolutionary storm is that the ruling class cannot govern in the old way. That is clearly the case in South Africa

today. The bourgeoisie has used up the political mechanism to rule society. On the one hand, its own forces, like the Democratic Alliance (DA), are far too weak and does not resonate with the masses. On the other hand the authority of the African National Congress (ANC) among the masses has never been lower. This explains the exponential growth in strikes, protests and demonstrations over the last period. There is a growing resentment against the traditional parties of the establishment. Workers, students and poor people increasingly feel the need to take matters into their own hands".

2.4 Fees Must Fall Movement at the University of Fort Hare in East London

Phandle (2016) states that according to the University of Fort Hare's chair of council, Thandi Orleyn, one of the main factors among many factors which are impacting the university after the first South African democratic elections in 1994 is the fact that the African National Congress government of that time did not embrace Fort Hare as the iconic struggle university. According to Phandle (2016), Orleyn further emphasises that: "Fort Hare could have been the preeminent post-apartheid university yet it struggled financially. Even now funding for black universities is not enough to put them on par with white universities (Phandle, 2016). The black universities, especially Fort Hare, got a raw deal" (Phandle, 2016). Madasa (2016) argues as well that the curriculum as well as the name of the University of Fort Hare needs to be decolonised. He further goes on to mention that the identity of the institution needs to put forward an African agenda.

The reasons for students' protests at the University of Fort Hare included facilities and infrastructure (such as expansion of buildings, shuttle services and inadequate library materials) (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014). In terms of financial aid the main issues which surfaced included: funding for postgraduate students, financial exclusions, shortage of National Student Financial Aid Scheme (NSFAS) funding, late payment of allowances and the extension of the NSFAS application deadline (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014). The management had responded by engaging the NSFAS and the Department of Higher Education and Training to deliver the necessary services and funding for deserving students (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014).

According to the Parliamentary Monitoring Group (2014) student accommodation at the University of Fort Hare is another issue of concern for students who demanded that more residences be built as residence fees at privately-owned accommodation were unaffordable. University of Fort Hare students who had one module left in order to graduate demanded academic exclusion and lamented that they should be allowed to rewrite an auto-supplementary examination (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014). The management of the University of Fort Hare responded to all the above mentioned issues and indicated that the policy of the university did allow students in such circumstances to write an auto-supplementary examination (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014).

Picture 1. 4 Students Protesting in Quigney, East London

Source: Daily Dispatch (23/10/2015).

Another contested issue at the University of Fort Hare was that of tuition fees. Students at the University of Fort Hare were unhappy with the tuition fee increases between 2010 and 2014. The University claimed that these tuition increases were necessary in order to harmonise the fees between the East London and Alice campuses, following the merger (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014). The university stated that several infrastructure projects were underway for student housing where residences were being renovated and upgraded and the construction of a new student village would be taking place (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014). The estimated total cost of these projects would be R258.6 million (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014).

According to the Parliamentary Monitoring Group (2014) the Student Representative Council of the University of Fort Hare stated the following: the students' perspective differed from that of the management of the University and the lack of funding was counter-productive. The Student Representative Council called on NSFAS to fund post-graduate students, not only to help students realise their academic endeavours, but also as an investment in research output (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014). The sky rocketing residence fees should be investigated and management has to ensure that students could afford the residence fees (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014). Collaboration between all stakeholders needed to be consistent and democratic at all times and issues should be settled internally (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014). NSFAS in particular should review its stance over the cancellation of historical debt, which hindered registration the following year (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014).

According to the Parliamentary Monitoring Group (2014) members of the committee of the University of Fort Hare, the University of Fort Hare and the Department of Higher Education (DHE) all came up with the following resolutions to try resolve the issue of student protests: facilitating investigations at other campuses and mobilizing other stakeholders to get involved (such as the Department of Higher Education, National Treasury, appropriations committees and NSFAS in dealing with financial challenges); researching the extent of the problem; and seeking to exempt disadvantaged universities from matching funds provisions, implementation of the national digital library, ensuring open communication between students and university management and swift action to resolve student grievances.

2014 recorded a number of 2093 students who were unfunded at the University of Fort Hare and this resulted in the highest number ever for the university (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014). As a result of these student grievances it is very critical to note that there have been protests at the University of Fort Hare every year since 2009 (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014). According to the University of Fort Hare, further legitimate and pertinent issues that they needed to address from students' perspectives included: additional funding promised in public to students, shortage of funding (for infrastructure development, university subsidies or NSFAS), broken promises from and within the sector and backlogs in infrastructure developments such as libraries, lecture theatres and laboratories (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014).

According to the Parliamentary Monitoring Group (2014) the measures which were put in place to address the above mentioned issues include: holding monthly stakeholder engagement forums, addressing administrative inefficiencies, conducting an audit and analysis of past years' memoranda, mediation and facilitation between and among all stakeholders in times of need and implementing a student leadership development training programme which included diversity management, conflict resolution, university policies and protocol and team building.

According to NSFAS there was a misalignment of the academic and financial years which resulted in the transfer of funding to universities. NSFAS also received funding in tranches and could not pay the universities as expected (Parliamentary Monitoring Group, 2014).

According to Tongai (2013) in February 2013 the University of Fort Hare students sent a list of their grievances to management and among these key issues were the rising cost of security and accommodation. Students (as stakeholders in the university) were unhappy that Fort Hare (which is a rural university in the Eastern Cape which mostly caters for students from poor backgrounds) was becoming too costly (Tongai, 2013). The steep increase in residence fees resulted in students protesting to express their disgruntlement (Tongai, 2013). The university authorities state that the fee increases were as a result of improved security measures which saw the installation of security gates, furniture changes and closed-circuit TV cameras (Tongai, 2013).

Nyanda (2016) states that in October of 2016 students shut down Fleet Street in Quigney as a form of protest. These protests brought the university to its knees as it was forced to shut down for weeks with students boycotting classes and demanding that their grievances be addressed by the university's leadership (Nyanda, 2016). Students blocked off the road outside the main East London campus and pelted cars and members of the public walking in the street with stones from the rooftop of a University of Fort Hare residence as well as starting fires in the streets (Nyanda, 2016).

According to Makgoba (2016) the Fees Must Fall movement is a protest for free tertiary education which can be characterised as one of "historical proportions". Wits University in Johannesburg is where the movement started and soon progressed into a national shutdown of universities, "South Africa has seen an increase in local and

often illegal and violent protest action which has mostly focused on public service delivery failures" (Makgoba, 2016).

Picture 1. 5 Heavy Police Presence on the University of Fort Hare East London Campus

Source: Daily Dispatch (13/10/2016).

Makgoba (2016) cites the findings of the South African Institute of Race Relations when he states that: "the Fees Must Fall protest action is unique as it found its way into government's buildings quicker than any other protest, especially student protests, because of social media".

On the Fees Must Fall movement the President of South Africa stated the following:

> Burning schools, libraries and university buildings means burning the future. History will judge those who burn university buildings and schools very harshly. There can be no justification of violence and anarchy especially in a country where people have freedom of speech and expression and where government has formal programmes of engaging people. We have a responsibility as leaders to ensure that our hard won freedom and democracy are defended and protected from those with

> sinister agendas who wish to sow mayhem and undermine our hard won freedom and democracy (Zuma, 2016).

Makgoba (2016) argues that the protest action which started at the University of Cape Town against a statue of Cecil John Rhodes and called for its removal set the mould for how the Fees Must Fall movement was implemented. Makgoba (2016) further states that this protest action allowed a healthy debate of other underlying issues faced by university students across the country due to its popularity online. These issues, amongst others, included the following: financial exclusion (University of Witwatersrand and the Tshwane University of Technology); alleged institutional racism (University of Cape Town); use of Afrikaans as only medium of instruction (Stellenbosch University); bad courier services, lack of access to computer laboratories, slow Wireless Fidelity (Wi-Fi) and against temp worker employment (University of South Africa) and NSFAS dependent students not receiving their qualifications due to funds not being available (Durban University) (Makgoba, 2016).

"I remain confused as to why universities cannot creatively leverage their positions to mobilise capital for all their students. They can use their large endowments and access to social capital in South Africa and international multinational companies where their funders and former students work" (Ngcaweni, 2015).

According to Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2016:52): "at the forefront of this Fees Must Fall struggle are students, many of whom were born after the disgruntlement of juridical apartheid but are experiencing cultural alienation, exclusion due to high fees and exposure to ideas of dead white men as a form of education inside universities".

Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2016) states that students across the nation joined forces to fight for and demand the following: cultural freedom, cognitive justice, curriculum should change and be revised, de-commissioning of offensive colonial/apartheid symbols, overall change of the idea of a university from its western pedigree to "African university" and the right to relevant, quality and free education.

In the current uprisings race as compared to class is still an invisible but active organising principle informing unchanging patterns of inequality, Eurocentric curriculum, poverty, alienating university cultures and use of foreign/colonial languages of instruction and standing apartheid/colonial symbols (Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2016).

2.5 Conclusion

The researcher is of the opinion that the South African education at tertiary institutions has not transformed much at grassroots level since apartheid. To date, education still privileges a few and students believe that fees is one of the infrastructures put in place to make sure it discriminates the poor from the middle class. The Fees Must Fall movement encompasses a whole variety of economic and socio-political issues which are interrelated and are not focused solely on the issue of fees as one would assume looking at it at face value. The Fees Must Fall movement illustrated an incredible rise in solidarity which transcended past race and which saw students from different universities come together to fight for one common cause and put whatever differences they might have aside and invest all their energy in fighting to liberate and empower themselves through education. The assertion is that education in South African tertiary institutions is not accessible and affordable to everyone because it is expensive.

CHAPTER THREE

Research Methodology

3.1 Introduction

This chapter outlines the research methodology that was used to collect data. The framework for conducting research is the methodology. Malhotre (2004:13) states that, "methodology encompasses the procedures that are necessary for the gathering of required information and its purpose is designing a study that will provide information needed for the decision making". The main themes which are addressed in this chapter include the following: research approach, research design, population for the study, research instruments, data collection procedure, data presentation and analysis as well as ethical considerations.

3.2 Research Approach

Qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of or interpret phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them (Babbie & Mouton, 2006). Qualitative research involves a variety of empirical materials and is used by the researcher because of its ability to describe and understand rather than explain human behaviour (Babbie & Mouton, 2006). According to Maykut & Morehouse (1994) the application of the qualitative research paradigm will help explain the researcher's belief about the nature of the social world and what can be known about it. The qualitative research paradigm allows the researcher to be central to the study and includes: words, opinions, pictures, drawings, paintings, photographs and films. It is not expressed in numbers. In this study the researcher employed the qualitative research paradigm because it gave a thorough interpretation of the data collected (Maykut & Morehouse, 1994).

The qualitative research paradigm approach was chosen for this study as it was a great tool in discovering trends in the opinions and thoughts of students who took part in the Fees Must Fall movement and helped the researcher to delve deeper into the underlying problem of student grievances at institutions of higher education and training in post-apartheid South Africa.

3.3 Research Design

McMilan & Schumacher (2006) define research design as a plan for the selection of research sites, subjects and data collection procedures to answer the research questions. The researcher utilised the case study research design. Bromley (2000:302) defines a case study as the following: "a case study research is a systematic inquiry into events or relatives which aims to describe and explain the phenomenon of interest". A case study was used in this study because the researcher sought an in-depth understanding of the student grievances that students had at the University of Fort Hare in East London which led to the Fees Must Fall movement. McMilan & Schumacher (2001:602) describe a survey research as: "the assessment of the current status, opinion, beliefs and attitudes by questionnaires or interviews from a known population".

This research employed qualitative techniques to conduct an exploratory study as it investigated an under-researched area of scholarship (Cresswell, 2009; Babbie & Mouton, 2011). This approach was used to understand the student grievances at institutions of higher education and training in post-apartheid South Africa and focused on the case of the Fees Must Fall movement at the University of Fort Hare in East London. This study made use of the qualitative research methodology in order to find answers to research questions. The use of qualitative research methods allowed the participants to freely express their feelings in terms of their livelihoods as students. In addition, the qualitative method is flexible and reflective enough to allow the researcher to use inductive reasoning to interpret and gain deeper understanding of the situation at hand, a view shared by Denzin & Lincoln (1998).

3.4 Population Sampling/Sampling

3.4.1 Population

"Population is a set of entities for which all the measurements of interest to the research are presented" (Powers, 2000:235). The researcher's main respondents of the study were the students of the University of Fort Hare (undergraduate and postgraduate students from across faculties and departments). The researcher's key informants were UFH university management/staff and UFH Student Representative Council (SRC) leaders. These main respondents and key informants were selected because of their first-hand experience of the situation, and their knowledge and ability to describe their perspectives on the matter of the Fees Must Fall movement.

3.4.2 Sampling

The choice of a sampling method determines the quality of results obtained (Cresswell, 2008). "Sampling refers to the process used to select a portion of the population for study" (Maree, 2008:79). This study made use of the purposive sampling method. Purposive sampling is a non-probability sampling method based on the subject decision of the researcher to pick specific respondents and leave out others without using any statistical or scientific basis (Acharya, Prakash, Saxena & Nigam, 2013). Purposive sampling was employed to select key informants who included student leaders, University of Fort Hare management/staff and students. Purposive sampling was employed because the researcher knew the exact key informants with the information the researcher wanted, which made purposive sampling the appropriate sampling method.

3.5 Research Instruments

3.5.1 Interviews

The researcher employed open-ended interviews that were administered face-to-face with participants. "Interviews is a two-way conversation initiated by the interviewer for the specific purpose of obtaining research information" (Cohen and Manion, 2007:271). Direct interaction between individuals by means of an interview is a way of gathering data and helping the researcher understand the participants' social reality. Open-ended interviews were utilised for key informants such as: the students of UFH; members of the UFH Student Representative Council/student leaders as well as UFH university management/staff.

3.5.2 Observation

Social scientists use a research technique called non-participant observation in order to record events and activities as they happen in a certain community (Bless, Higson-Smith & Kagee, 2006). The collection of information is done through observing the behaviour of an individual/s interacting in a social setting. Observations require little or no interaction and subjects are unaware that they are under observation (Deutsh & Cook, 1961). During the research, the researcher was with the students when they were embarking on demonstrations and strikes as an observer as well as during normal daily operations of the university. This gave the researcher an opportunity to observe and listen to conversations of interest that students were having. The observation not only happened during these demonstrations and protests but also

throughout the researcher's studies. This allowed the researcher to get a first-hand unfiltered account of the raw emotions the students were experiencing.

3.6 Data Presentation and Analysis

In social sciences various approaches can be used to analyse the data that is collected by a researcher. The data analysis process is where the researcher makes sense of the information that he/she collected. The researcher utilised content analysis and the thematic approach for qualitative data analysis as recommended by McMilan & Schumacher (2006). The data is presented in a narrative analysis. For this study, narrative analysis is important because it allows the students, student representative council leaders and university management/staff to narrate their experiences first hand. This assisted and allowed the researcher to have a better understanding of the situation and enabled her to make the necessary deductions and conclusions.

The following steps were adhered to when the qualitative analysis for this study was conducted by the researcher:

Step One: A list of questions (which was asked to participants) was drafted.

Step Two: In order to check the relevance of the list of questions the researcher drafted, they were sent to the supervisor.

Step Three: Fieldwork was done in order to conduct the interviews. The researcher carried a pencil and notepad.

Step Four: The researcher went through the interviews which were written down by students and paid extra attention to script them as is so as not to tamper with the information.

Step Five: The data which was gathered from the field was compared with the information documented in the literature review in order to interpret the results.

Step Six: The University of Fort Hare's library will make the researcher's publication available to the public.

3.7 Location of the Study

The researcher conducted this study at the University of Fort Hare (East London Campus) which is situated in Buffalo City which is a metropolitan municipality. Buffalo City is situated in the Eastern Cape Province in South Africa. The University of Fort

Hare bears a very rich history and legacy of grooming prominent African heads of states yet there is little to show active participation in city development within the parameters of the Buffalo City. The researcher focused on a local scale rather than focusing on the national scale due to various limitations which were experienced such as time and finance and also because this study is a mini-dissertation.

3.8 Ethical Considerations

In carrying out research, it is important to determine ethical issues involved in the collection of data. Cresswell (2009) defines ethics as moral standards which are widely accepted when applied to a situation. The consideration of different ethics enables the researcher to avoid potential conflicts and protect the respondents in several ways.

Ethical principles and issues in social research are present in both qualitative and quantitative research even if the actual details involved may differ greatly (Flick, 2011). According to Clough & Nut (2007:96) "all research must be interrogated for the means by which it 'protects' the interests of the participants". As a result, all the participants who participated in this study were assured of confidentiality and anonymity (Terreblanche, Durrheim & Painter, 1999). The researcher protected the data gathered, as well as the identities of all the participants involved in the research process.

The participants received a clear explanation of the task expected of them so that they could make an informed decision to participate voluntarily in the research (Terreblanche et al., 1999). The most significant concern within professional research guidelines is often that none of the participants are coerced into participating in the study and thus any involvement will be voluntary (Miller & Bell, 2002).

Furthermore, according to Miller & Bell (2002) obtaining written consent from participants has become increasingly more important to researchers and poses new ethical considerations. Also informing the participants about the full details of the study, as well as obtaining their written consent before the interview commences is very important (Miller & Bell, 2002). Thus participants in this study were asked to sign a consent form before the interview took place. This research design does not involve any form of deception and, as highlighted by Bulmer (1982) who was cited by Denzin & Lincoln (2005:145), "deception is neither ethically justified nor practically necessary, nor in the best interest of sociology as an academic pursuit".

As the research elicited particularly sensitive and personal information, ethical standards and considerations were highly relevant. By following the correct channels to identify participants and getting participants to voluntarily consent to participation, ethical problems were avoided. Emphasis was given to complete confidentiality and anonymity in the collection and analysis of data and the reporting of the findings. Participants were given full details on the aims and objectives of the research as well as the publication of findings in the University of Fort Hare research report. No names are used in the reporting of the findings and only the researcher knows the identity of the participants. Participants were assured of their freedom to withdraw from the research at any time and for any reason.

3.9 Conclusion

This chapter gave in-depth detail on the methodology, research design, research approach, data collection and analysis, population sampling, location of the study as well as the ethical considerations which were utilised in this study.

CHAPTER FOUR

Data Presentation and Analysis

4.1 Introduction

This chapter will focus on the presentation and analysis of the data which was collected during fieldwork. Purposive sampling was carried out to determine the participants that would be included in this study. Descriptive analysis and the thematic approach was used to digest the information collected.

4.2 Students' Understanding of the Fees Must Fall Movement

Most students seemed to have a clear understanding of what the Fees Must Fall movement was all about as well as the role they had to play. Most students narrated that socioeconomic aspects have left most poor people struggling to earn a living and support their families.

Langa (2016) observes that in 2015/2016 student-led protests at universities gained momentum and spread across the country. The Fees Must Fall movement was born and its purpose was to spark heated debates on fee increases in universities (Booysen, 2016). Langa also indicated that the message that was being conveyed by the Fees Must Fall movement is that the costs of higher education were too high and unaffordable for the majority of poor black students from disadvantaged backgrounds. One can therefore deduce that in post-apartheid South Africa students' protests against fees are nothing new and are an extension of the unresolved past, especially in historically black universities such as the University of Fort Hare. Below are students' responses on what the Fees Must Fall movement means to them and what role they played during the protests which resonate with observations made by scholars such as Langa:

Interviewee 1 stated the following:

Fees must fall means that we are working hand-in-hand with our parents financially and not only that, but we are fighting financial struggles of the next generation that is us being parents and having to pay sky high fees for our children. I did not really do much during the protest. As I mentioned that we ourselves will become parents one day and the fact that the government wants us to know that we will be in debt in the future is not the proper way to do things and this will lead to our generation also contributing to the poor savings rate of South Africa. This will be basically a repetition of what our parents went through and the main aim here is that we do not want our children to be part of the sandwich generation of which we already fall (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 2 stated the following:

Fees Must Fall means that the tuition fees must decrease next year, and in the coming years education must be free for all South African citizens. I did not play that much role but to help the protestors march a peaceful strike. The issue that I have and that has the most impact on me is the student debt that I am currently in, I will have to pay back all the NSFAS fees I used for my studies, even though I will have to pay 40% of the total fees, the debt is still a huge issue that has the most negative impact (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 3 stated the following:

The meaning of fees must fall to me is that a door must open for all students who failed to proceed with their tertiary education due to lack of funds. As an SRC leader, I was mobilizing people to engage in this protest taking them from their residents because this issue was affecting every student even some students they were saying fees must fall issue does not affect us because our tuition is being paid by donors . I personally come across a student saying " why should I protest because my fees is not paid by my parents ", but that is not the case of who is paying the tuition for you. The issues which are most impact to me are, there are some students from villages and townships who do not have access to tertiary education because they are lacking funds, those students will end up involved in drugs because they will not have things to do, but if the education is free for all everyone will have an opportunity to get the access to the tertiary education (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 4 stated the following:

Fees must fall meant fighting for the next generation. To ensure everyone would be able to study in the future. I didn't play an active role in the protest but I fully supported the protest. The fact that fees must fall was the main issue; we know free education is farfetched so that I didn't expect. Also acknowledgment that things get expensive so fees had to increase but the outrageous percentage increase were too much (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 5 stated the following:

Fees must fall means a lot to me because my parents were never going to afford the increase. They can hardly afford to pay them now. Well I didn't do much in the strike besides strike and chant. Well the issues of affordability of fees affect me the most (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 6 stated the following:

#Fees must fall# means getting an affordable education or even free education. I participated in the protest because it is my duty as an SRC leader by posting an article on the university's Facebook wall, mobilising students and also engaging in the protest. The issue of student debt is of most impact because I had to drop out because of the debt. I was excluded from registration and was unable to access my results last year. Also, the issue of the registration fee is also of foremost impact because I can't afford it (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 7 stated the following:

Fees must fall is a campaign by students who are standing in solidarity to ensure that South African students have access to free and quality education. This is because, many students from previously disadvantaged backgrounds have to acquire loans to pay off their student debt, and the interest on student loans is so ridiculous that after university, when you are working, all you will be doing is paying off debt. I did not play a major role in the fees must fall campaign, I did not even participate in the protests because in East London they were violent and unsafe. I am one of the students that owe large sums of money towards student loans like NSFAS, therefore fees must fall impacts me. After all I am faced with the daunting thought of paying off my NSFAS debt as soon as I am employed and am able to pay the money back (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 8 stated the following:

It is not of any relevance to me this year as I was funded by Bank Seta and my fees were paid up however if it had occurred the year before or even earlier it would have some significance. In that it would mean that I would be fighting off the burden that my parents would have to endure in raising four children with a salary of a teacher and still maintain the household and also take care of their personal necessities. So an increment in fees would mean that they would have to forfeit one of these needs of which they are all a priority. I did not play any role in the protest and was just a spectator. The biggest issue that would be of impact to me would be the increase in fees as it would mean that if ever I would want to pursue my Masters next year I would have to pay extra on my own as my parents have played their part so in furthering my education I would be responsible (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 9 stated the following:

#Feesmustfall came at a time when I was struggling to pay off my outstanding debt. Although I was not actively involved in the protest, I identified with the struggle of all the other students in the protest. Accommodation is particularly expensive for the quality on offer. With the intentions of completing a postgraduate qualification next year, the general feeling is that fees might get out of hand (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 10 stated the following:

Fees must fall means tuition fees, registration fees and residence fees must not keep on increasing yearly. I didn't play any role and was just following on the news and social media. The registration fee have the most impact on me as they have to be paid at the worst time of the year, this is because my parents are still recovering from December expenditure and then have to send us back to school with all these costs involved (09/09/2017).

Most students that were interviewed identified high costs of university education and unaffordability as the main drivers of the Fees Must Fall movement. Students feared that if this issue was not addressed early, then they were heading to a debt riddled future, something that their parents already battled with.

4.3 Students' Perspective on the State of Funding and Student debt at the University of Fort Hare

Most students reported to having a student debt which they say affects them negatively. With their parents' aspirations, hopes and dreams resting on their shoulders students fear starting a working career with a significant amount of debt. Students resent the reality that they will be working to pay off their student debts instead of using it to support themselves and their families. Students also stated that having debt was not only affecting them emotionally but was also a disadvantage to them as they could not access their results and be able to evaluate their progress academically.

Langa (2016:7) argues the following:

> Problems with historically black universities can be traced back to the politics of higher education funding post-1994 and the decision by the state to reduce higher education institutions from 36 to 21 through the mechanism of mergers. One of the key reasons for the merger of institutions of higher learning was to facilitate transformation and improve (especially black) students' access to higher education and financial support. However it appears that many of these ideals were not achieved post the mergers because many universities are still marked by differences based on the material, cultural and social positions of their separate histories.

According to Booysen (2016) through the protests of the Fees Must Fall movement across all South African universities, public awareness was raised about the shortage of funding for higher education. Had protests not been organised, this awareness would not have occurred (Langa, 2016). A zero percent fee increment for the year 2016 was announced by President Jacob Zuma in response to the immense pressure the state was put under (Booysen, 2016). Langa (2016) states that since the protests the government also committed to ploughing additional funding into the NSFAS to financially support university students. The protests prove to have been an effective tool of communication as it can be argued that some of these changes would not have taken place if the students had not organised protests (Langa, 2016).

Below are students' responses on the state of funding and student debt at the University of Fort Hare:

Interviewee 1 stated the following:

I do not have any student debt (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 2 stated the following:

I am not quite sure but the last time I checked it was approximately R245000.00. I am always worried about how will I repay the student debt that I am in and that in the near future I would not be able to progress with my working life without paying the debt it is really stressful (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 3 stated the following:

Currently I am having a debt of R34 754. I have not accumulated any student debt. The effect of this debt to me is a burden and keeps on haunting me. It is even affecting my performance because I will not be able see my results, to check if there is any improvement or any underperformance (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 4 stated the following:

I do not have any student debt currently. However when I had debt I could not view my results. I had to work really hard to get distinctions to help pay for fees. I tutored on the side but I could not receive my salary because my fees were not paid up (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 5 stated the following:

I owe roughly R100 000. My debt stresses me out and when I stress I cannot study. This then affects my studies and I end up not studying properly and failing (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 6 stated the following:

The interviewee said he has accumulated a student debt of about R37, 000 plus, excluding this year's debt. He said: *Well, it affects my experience because I do not have access to my results, I do not know the courses I have passed and the ones I have not. I am just moving like a blind person. It is also holding me back as I had to drop out, it has extended my years of study, and I should have graduated (09/09/2017).*

Interviewee 7 stated the following:

I have accumulated a student debt that is possibly R50 000 under NSFAS, excluding interest. It affects my student life in terms of being pressured to achieve good grades so that I may get a good job and earn a salary that will allow me to pay this debt off as fast as I can because I am against debt (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 8 stated the following:

I accumulated some debt in my second year of studying which was my tuition fee funded by NSFAS. It affects my student experience in that I always think when I work I first have to settle it or will I be able to acquire any assets if I have not paid up the debt or even how long will it take before I can have anything of my own (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 9 stated the following:

I owe the school a little over R10 000. To supplement my parents' efforts I had decided to become a tutor. However, my meagre salary was also subject to a 60% deduction since I owe the school. To top it off, some of it went to tax although I was not supposed to pay taxes. Even though I am a man of faith, I have not seen my results because they have been withheld due to financial reasons. I am also working as a part time waiter at a nearby restaurant, and it has been difficult to balance his school work and work commitments considering the busy schedule for a final year accounting student (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 10 stated the following:

I have no debt that is due to UFH in my name. And when I have student debt it means that my results will not be released which means that I cannot evaluate my progress and move on to another level consciously (09/09/2017).

Most students are plagued by the issue of having student debt. By participating in the Fees Must Fall movement they had hoped for ways to alleviate their main burden which is that of fees.

4.4 Students' Perspectives on the University of Fort Hare Residences and whether or not they Reside in the Residences

Most students stated that they resided in residences. Students further stated that the residence fees were way too exorbitant for the conditions that they were living under. Students complained that residences were noisy, overcrowded, dilapidated and not conducive to learning and with that being said there was a general consensus among students that the residences needed an upgrade.

According to Cassim (2015), the Chairperson of the Democratic Alliance Youth, the University of Fort Hare needs to put an end to the exploitation of its students in residences at the University's East London campus. Cassim (2015) argues that: "It is important for all students to have access to decent living and learning environments in which to succeed academically". Cassim (2015) noted the following concerns that were brought to his attention by the students of Fort Hare residing in residences:

- There is insufficient space for students with many still remaining without a place to sleep;
- Residence fees have increased substantially from R19 000 per year in 2013 to R26 000 in 2015 whilst the average cost for a private room in the suburb of Quigney in East London is less than R2 000 a month;

- All students in residences are charged R26 000 per year which is added to their NSFAS debt irrespective of whether they stay in a single room or share with as many as three other students in poor conditions;
- Students are being charged for twelve months whilst they occupy their rooms for only 10 months; and
- High fees are charged whilst in 2014 the University of Fort Hare lost R6 million due to maladministration in the residence office.

Below are students' responses on the University of Fort Hare residences and whether or not they reside in residences:

Interviewee 1 stated the following:

Yes I am currently living in the school (university) *residence, the conditions in residence are not that bad but I think there are some improvements that can be done. My experience about residence life is not that bad but I had a few challenges that I faced like the level of noise it gets difficult to study in residence during exam time because of too much noise level, residence gets too overpopulated because of squatters and the security of students is not well taken care of (09/09/2017).*

Interviewee 2 stated the following:

I am not in a school residence (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 3 stated the following:

Yes I am at a school residence. The residence is dilapidated and full of cockroaches. I like residence because I am close to my peers and school, however living in residence sucks I do not like the atmosphere at all (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 4 stated the following:

I am not staying in the school residence (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 5 stated the following:

I have stayed in residence throughout my schooling career, but I wish I had stayed in private accommodation because I feel I do not get value for money staying in school residence. Although not in the worst of conditions, I feel the facilities could do with an upgrade (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 6 stated the following:

I am not living at residence. But I was registered to stay at residence during my first year and residence should be a home away from home and that is not what I got as a result I moved out after a few weeks because of its appalling conditions. It was really not worth the money that my parents would be paying (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 7 stated the following:

I am not in a university residence because of the degrading conditions that most Fort Hare residences present to students. I stay at a student commune that is in no way connected to the University of Fort Hare and it is in a good condition, clean and safe. I have never been a part of a student residence (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 8 stated the following:

I am living at home (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 9 stated the following:

I am not in a school residence; I am residing in a private accommodation (commune). The conditions are fairly good as compared to the experience I had in the school residence. I stayed in the school residence for about 3 weeks in my first year and I was not happy with living conditions as they were not conducive for student learning. And the cost was much higher than the place I reside in now with a difference of R7 000 in 2012, probably even higher now (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 10 stated the following:

I am not staying on residence because of the prices of the residence they are too expensive but the services which are offered are very poor , so I decided to stay out of residents (09/09/2017).

For most students, residences are supposed to be a home away from home which is conducive to learning but the current state of residences has left many students disgruntled and opting to reside in private accommodation as it is cheaper, safer and neater.

4.5 Students' Perspectives on what they do to Socialize and whether or not Fort Hare Residences Offer a Platform for Students to Socialize

Most students state that Fort Hare does not offer an adequate platform for students to socialize in their spare time. Students suggested that a games room and a student hub be built in order for students to socialize. Most students residing at residence stated that they were not happy with the lack of internet access at residences yet it is one of the charges that is charged on their residence fees. They feel internet access is important in order to catch up on work or entertain themselves.

Below are students' responses on what they do to socialise and whether or not Fort Hare residences offer them a platform to socialise:

Interviewee 1 stated the following:

I frequently make music on my spare time, I am usually in the studio or performing in the nearby pubs. I do not think so as it is very difficult to find other students in the city because we are mixed with the working class so most of the time we interact with the

working class. Yes I do find it really frustrating that the residences have no Wi-Fi because we cannot work on work assignment and research in our residence so we force to go to campus. I think every residence needs to have an internet and games room where students can go to, to socialise (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 2 stated the following:

If I am not studying then I am out and about with friends. I usually go to Vincent or Hemmingways for shopping, watch a movie, and chat over supper or drinks with my pocket money. Yes I think there are enough facilities to socialize (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 3 stated the following:

To socialize I just sit in my room and chill with my friends. I don't go anywhere, just buy junk food and eat. I do not believe that there are adequate facilities for students to socialize. I cannot even survive because the internet is my life and the lack of Wi-Fi at residence really affects me. I suggest the University builds a student hub, where students can hang and chill and socialize (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 4 stated the following:

I spend my spare time at home with my girlfriend and I go to church on weekends. I socialize with friends most times and sometimes at my friend's house braaing and relaxing. I do not think there are sufficient facilities to socialize, because if they were sufficient, we won't have students all over the pubs/clubs relaxing. All students do to relax is to go clubbing. Yes, it is frustrating not to have access to the internet because internet is a big part of our academic work, we find most information through it and a lack of it shows we are behind in terms of time and the access is low and frustrating. Also, there are few Laptops in the computer laboratories and thus we can't meet deadlines, thus frustrating. I suggest that there should be provision of laptops for each student on campus in the laboratories. Also, WI-FI access should be provided for all residences (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 5 stated the following:

During my spare time, I hang around with friends and I sometimes go to watch soccer at sports bars mostly during weekends. There's not much to choose from in terms of places to hang around with my friends. Student life is not as vibrant in East London as in places like Rhodes in Grahamstown for example. The lack of internet in residences and on campus is very annoying to say the least. To improve internet access, a competitive Information Technology (IT) support department would be a good start (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 6 stated the following:

I always chill in my room with my friends. We usually go for shopping at Hemingways mall, go for burger specials at buccaneers, go clubbing at this place in Berea called Ohmi. I believe there are adequate student facilities for student socialisation but the problem is that other students are not aware of these place maybe for financial reasons or for whatever reason. The commune I stay at has Wi-Fi and as honours students we have our own laboratory so the Wi-Fi thing is not major problem with me. The university has provided us with a common laboratory but they should try to fix the laptops

because most of the laptops are hardly working. And also making sure that residences that a far away from the campus have Wi-Fi (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 7 stated the following:

I spend most of my time on campus at the Economics Honours laboratory, or in my room. East London does not really give us a lot of options when it comes to social areas therefore I don't go out much. I sometimes go to restaurants in the malls, or beachfront like Café Neo, Buccaneers or Bora Bora. Like I said, there aren't sufficient areas to socialise in East London, besides restaurants, bars, and clubs. With regards to the Wi-Fi situation, our commune has Wi-Fi so I don't relate much to Wi-Fi struggles. But I do feel for other students without this opportunity as most things that students do require internet access. This is why you find Fort Hare laboratories over crowded, and students being attacked by criminals when returning from the laboratories to their residences in the evenings. Fort Hare could help by recognising Wi-Fi as one of students' basic needs rather than as a luxury and thereafter ensure that all Fort Hare residences have Wi-Fi access (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 8 stated the following:

I run a ballet community programme and that's where I devote my time. In the city I socialise in the malls and love trying new restaurants. No there are not enough sufficient facilities for students to socialise and interact on campus and in the city. I also feel that there is adequate internet access on campus (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 9 stated the following:

In my spare time I relax and watch a movie or series, go out with friends. We socialize at Buccaneers, Café Neo, Hemmingways, Vincent and so on with our pocket money, we go out to watch a movie, have supper and drinks, etc. I think there are not enough facilities for students to socialize on the campus as all these places I have named are a distance away from residences meaning it requires money for you to travel and entertain yourself. Internet access in the campus can be quite frustrating more especially when you have deadlines to meet but most of the time it is available but in certain areas of the campus. The University should increase the accessibility of the net and ensure that it is extensively available where students can just hang out and do their work without having to look specifically for a certain place (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 10 stated the following:

I spend my spare time at my place reading novels; I socialize with others at the beach front but it's not always the case of going to the beach, so social life is limited especially in this city. There are no enough facilities for students to socialize, students they only stay at their residences and most of the residence they don't have internet facilities, students are forced to go to school to use internet facility. The fun party of it they charge internet facility on the resident's fees but they don't offer that service. Even electricity is a problem at residents students are being disadvantaged because of the load shedding. I suggest that each residence must have a generator in case of load shedding (09/09/2017).

According to John Hopkins University (2013) "school-life balance is important for optimal academic functioning. Students often prioritize academics at the expense of personal factors, including relationships and exercise. This can lead to a decline in academic performance, as general health and well-being are critical to optimal academic functioning". This therefore emphasises the importance of a social life in order to ensure that students not only excel as students but are also well rounded individuals.

4.6 Students' Perspectives on Sport and Recreation at the University of Fort Hare

Most students are dissatisfied with the fact that the UFH East London campus does not have their own sports grounds and that students who participate in sports have to travel to the UFH Alice campus for practice. Most students would like to see the creation of a varsity gym which offers reasonable student prices. Most students cannot afford to go to other gyms as they are out of their budget.

Below are students' responses on their perspectives on sport and recreation at the University of Fort Hare:

Interviewee 1 stated the following:

I would like to see more sports grounds around the city or parks. I usually lift weights with my friend. I do not feel the sporting facilities at UFH are adequate, because UFH does not even have fitness gym for its students except those who are in sports (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 2 stated the following:

I would like to see more libraries and more sport grounds at UFH. For physical fitness I jog in the morning and evening (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 3 stated the following:

I walk to school for physical fitness and I believe there are sporting resources for students (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 4 stated the following:

I would like to see a fitness centre that offers a student rate, by a student rate, I mean cheaper rate for students. I jog and walk for physical fitness. I also train at home such as push-ups and sit-ups. There is no adequate fitness centre in the school as the only game centre they had in the school has been closed down and it is no longer available (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 5 stated the following:

I love sports but it is a shame that the campus in East London does not offer anything tangible in this regard. There are no sports facilities on the campus and those who participate in some of the activities have to travel all the way to the UFH Alice campus just for practice. I used to go to the gym but not anymore (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 6 stated the following:

A student centre would be proper just a place for us to chill, shop and party maybe. I sometimes jog and that's it because we do not have a varsity gym (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 7 stated the following:

I would like to see perhaps a free gym for students, pool area, and probably a cinema in town. Those are just the basic things that could make student life in East London more interesting. I do not do much for physical fitness, I have tried the gym now and again but get derailed by school work. There aren't adequate facilities for student fitness and recreation, Fort Hare does not even have sports fields (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 8 stated the following:

For students there are not adequate facilities for student fitness and recreation because you have to pay for everything (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 9 stated the following:

A strictly student fitness gym would be a great start where the packages cater specifically for students unlike the local gyms that are rather costly for students. I walk to and from school every day which is about 4kms. There aren't enough facilities for students as the city mostly caters for the working class (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 10 stated the following:

I have no interest in sports. I'm just here to get my degree (09/09/2017).

According to the University of Fort Hare official website (27/05/2017):

> Sport is one of those activities that transcend the mere satisfaction of physical sporting endeavour. The significance of sport as shaping your character has been echoed by thousands of top athletes across the sporting spectrum. The advantages and benefits of participating in sport are: improved health, meeting new people and developing friendships, the opportunity to play at the highest level as determined by you and being a role model to be emulated by your peers. However, sport participation also has its demands. In order to enhance your performance at any level you need to possess the following characteristics: commitment to participate and meet the required rules for such participation; discipline to participate within the rules of the competition and respect match officials, club officials, team mates and spectators; dedication to be a team player and place a high premium on the success of the team; determination to stay the course and not quit. However, the greatest demand will be how you manage your time between academic achievement and sport

participation. Thousands of students have managed to do so and in the process have developed into well balanced individuals because sport is an integral part of student life.

Sport is a very important aspect of student life and it offers students an opportunity to interact with individuals on a social level and allows them to have a sense of belonging and pride as part of a sporting team. The University of Fort Hare should strongly consider the recommendation of students to have a university gym and for the university to secure its on sports grounds so that students don't have to travel far in order to meet their sporting requirements.

4.7 Students' Perspectives on the Crime Rate in the City of East London

There was a unanimous opinion amongst students that the city of East London is not safe, with many relaying stories of their own personal experiences of being victims of crime. In order for them to feel safe students shared the same sentiments that police patrol and visibility as well as the introduction of shuttle services for students both during the day and at night will make them feel safer.

Below are students' responses on their perception of the crime rates in the city of East London:

Interviewee 1 stated the following:

There is a lot of crime in the residence that goes unnoticed. No I do not feel safe, and usually we get off late of campus and a lot of students have been robbed on their way from library to their residence. I think there need to be police patrolling around residences and the campus, also shuttles can be made available (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 2 stated the following:

The crime rate in my neighbourhood is quite high, and has impacted my life in that I live in fear as people get robbed day and night so I do not feel safe in the city. The schools and the municipality should ensure that the police and safety authorities do their job (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 3 stated the following:

It even makes it so hard for me to walk with my laptop cause I fear for it and I fear that it might get stolen. I also do not go to school at night cause I fear walking at night. I suggest that police vans be deployed to scout the area all the time and clean up the streets (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 4 stated the following:

The impact of crime on students in the city neighbourhood is that crime some of the students even participate in the crime. They are students in the day and turtles at night.

I kind of feel safe in this city. What can be done to improve the situation is the responsibilities of everyone and not just that of the authorities or South African Police Service (SAPS) alone (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 5 stated the following:

The school residence is relatively safe but the neighbourhood is a different story. I never walk around late at night because Quigney is a dangerous neighbourhood. Regrettably however, I do not know what can be done and I do not think the situation will change (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 6 stated the following:

Quigney is one of the top areas that have high crime rates and I cannot just walk from school to my place at night even in a group these thugs are not afraid of people walking in groups. I am neutral about safety in this town it really depends where I am because at Oxford Street I am not safe and then walking in Vincent maybe I tend to be more relaxed. Not much can be done actually but the police can patrol in places like Quigney, Southernwood places where students live because at times in fact most times we are victims because of our gadgets (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 7 stated the following:

Quigney has a very high crime rate, I never feel safe walking around during the evening. I would never even try to walk from campus to where I reside when it is already dark. More police patrols can be set up to ensure the safety of students, or shuttle services can be provided for university students (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 8 stated the following:

The crime is ridiculous. I'm too scared to stay out late at night, certain places I cannot go. I am even too scared to use a public bathroom. I do not feel safe at all in the city. I do not think anything can be done to improve this situation because. There are only so many police officers and they cannot control or eliminate all crime (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 9 stated the following:

There is a lot of crime in the city but it has not affected my residence directly thus far. However there is always that feeling of being unsafe when you are walking the streets and so on. The SAPS and various protection units of the city should join forces and create a forum that is specifically aimed at protecting students around the city because I believe we are the most vulnerable as some of us are new to the place and don't have any experience of this kind of setting (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 10 stated the following:

Personally like I said I do not stay in the residence so I do not even know the crime rate there. But from what I heard from other students who stays at the residence. The only resident which has a high crime rate its Elwande. I feel safe in this city. To improve this situation of crime they must be strictly security and also the students should help the securities to stop crime (09/09/2017).

According to Nini & Daymani (2017) the latest crime statistics that were released by Police Minister Fikile Mbalula in October stated that an individual has a higher chance of being raped or murdered in the Eastern Cape than in any other South African province in 2016/2017. The report, which covered the period between April 2016 and March 2017, states that the Eastern Cape has the highest rape and murder ratios in the entire country (Nini & Daymani, 2017). Burglaries at residential premises; robbery; stock theft; theft out of motor vehicles and aggravated robberies were on the increase in the Eastern Cape (Nini & Daymani, 2017). The Eastern Cape had the highest increases in malicious damage to property; arson cases; theft out of motor vehicles and contact-related crimes (Nini & Daymani, 2017). There have been decreases however in the number of carjacking, shoplifting, sexual offences, assault with intent to do grievous bodily harm and cash-in-transit vehicle cases in the Eastern Cape Province (Nini & Daymani, 2017).

With the crime rate in the Eastern Cape being so alarmingly high it is important that safety measures are put in place to ensure that students are not added onto the growing list of statistics. The University of Fort Hare could consider collaborating with the South African Police Service or private security companies as well as the municipality in order to come up with safety measures to ensure student safety.

4.8 Students' Perspectives on the Academic Facilities of the University of Fort Hare

Most students stated that the library is the University of Fort Hare's best asset. However, they also stated that other academic facilities needed to be upgraded to meet university standards such as: the computer laboratories; online registration system; finance offices need to be sped up and improved; and lecture venues and the buildings need to be revamped and expanded to fit the capacity of students.

The University of Fort Hare official website (2013) states the following:

> Our East London campus is based in the largest non-metropolitan city in South Africa, with a diverse mix of students and the urban facilities that make it easier to attract best students and staff. The East London campus has a well-established academic base in the four faculties of humanities and social sciences, management and commerce, education and law, with academic excellence in the highly rated primary education degree, diploma and certificate, a strong reputation in commerce, research capacity in the Fort Hare Institute of Social and Economic Research (FHISER) and the Johnson and Johnson Leadership Institute providing management development courses.

Below are students' responses on the academic facilities of the University of Fort Hare:

Interviewee 1 stated the following:

The best facilities in the university are the library because the noise level is too low and the books on short loan are made available. I think that the university laboratories need more computers for the students doing their undergraduate degrees (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 2 stated the following:

The best assets in the university are the library and the computer laboratories. What is lacking are proper lecture venues, bigger library and residences (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 3 stated the following:

The computer laboratories are the best facilities at the university and a proper library, more computer laboratories and more study venues and a large and cheap café need to be considered to improve the university (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 4 stated the following:

The only acceptable place in the school is the library, it is not even a best asset, it is just acceptable. Yho! What is not lacking at this university? No proper management, student leadership and academic facilities such as computer laboratories. Everything is lacking in this university, in fact it should be shut down, I am angry at the moment (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 5 stated the following:

The first thing that is needed is a well serviced library. Up to now, I do not think the facilities are anywhere near university standards. The computer laboratories are a mess, there are no student centres (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 6 stated the following:

What can I say is best about UFH? Not much can be said you know but I know that it is only accessible to particular individuals but the Economics Honours Laboratory is one of the greatest assets of the university with all their advanced technology. Right now I cannot think on many things besides the fact that the university needs to work its online registration system, shuttles for students to and from school, the computer laboratories need a revamp in terms of their laptops (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 7 stated the following:

Fort Hare has an impressive library, and the faculty computer laboratories are outstanding too. I know the Accounting laboratory, Information Systems Honours Laboratory and the Economics Honours laboratory and I must say the Economics Honours laboratory surpasses all outstanding areas at the university. Thanks to Bank Seta, the sponsor that made that happen. The university lacks shuttle services for starters, adequate computers for students in the common area laboratories like the Baobab laboratory and the Mtiza laboratory, these are often over-crowded and as a

result stand the risk of theft and being vandalised. Also, the University does not do much for students after they have graduated, all it does is provide education with no skills to help you after you graduate as a result Fort Hare graduates find it difficult to be employed (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 8 stated the following:

I am not sure about the best assets or places in this university. The lacking part is the finance offices seriously needs to be sped up or improved (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 9 stated the following:

The only place that I would say is the best asset to the university is the library and the computer laboratories although they do not cater for the number of students that the university has, as a result some students use lecture venues to study during exam time. What is lacking in the university is the infrastructure in terms of land and buildings to expand its capacity and the right management to coordinate such so that every students benefits from the facilities that the university offers (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 10 stated the following:

The library is the best place on the campus and there is poor security, just about anyone can enter the building without producing student identity card (09/09/2017).

It is clear that most students feel that the facilities in the University of Fort Hare are far from where they need to be. Students feel that the only prestigious and attractive thing about the university is the fact that it has a rich history. Students state that the university should build and own their own buildings instead of leasing one and that the major issues that need to be addressed include: an unattractive city campus; lack of infrastructure and facilities; lack of academic facilities; poor financial management and crime.

4.9 Students' Perception of the City of East London

Most students stated that they do not see themselves settling in the city of East London after their studies for the following reasons: it is a small city that lacks job opportunities and it has a high crime rate. Other students stated that they would reside in East London after their studies for the following reasons: it is easy to navigate around East London and it is a relaxed slow paced city with no pressure. Most stated that they do not see themselves growing in a city like East London and suggested that the city concentrate on investing in student activities by collaborating with the University of Fort Hare in order to offer students a well-rounded city campus life.

Below are students' responses on their perception of the city of East London:

Interviewee 1 stated the following:

The city itself and the availability of good infrastructure is a positive aspect of East London. The crime surrounding the city campus I think a city that is well patrolled by the police that puts first the safety of the students around the city is what is needed. The university needs to get shuttles for students to take them from their respective residence and organise police to be patrolling around the residence, I think the city should deploy a lot of police to assist the university. Students should not get themselves into the city pubs and only go out when the school has a gig. I do not see myself settling in East London because it is very small city and lacking better opportunities (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 2 stated the following:

So far nothing has been attractive for me on the city campus and what has been unattractive are the street vendors outside the campus and the campus itself is too small for its number of students and there is also no cafeteria or just somewhere to relax before or after lectures. An ideal city for students would be one with bigger lecture venues, a cafeteria, and student centre. The university should build a bigger building rather than lease one out, so that it occupies as much students as it enrols. And no I don't think I would settle in the city as the crime rate is too high (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 3 stated the following:

There is no attractive feature in East London besides the beach. East London needs plenty of job opportunities for students and places to chill. The university needs to improve residences and our campus. The city needs to concentrate on improving the city as there are no enough opportunities here that can help me grow which is why I don't see myself settling here after studying (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 4 stated the following:

The only attractive thing about the city campus is the name Fort Hare and the history. Once you get here, you find out there is nothing attractive. The things I consider unattractive in the city campus are lack of infrastructure and facilities, lack of academic facilities, poor financial management and crime. An ideal city for student is that which does not have students scattered all around the city. According to me, the university should see to it that all the student need are met without having to protest. The city should invest in student activities as well as institutions and that students should work in partnership with the city as well as the university management to meet students' need. I do not foresee myself settling in east London. I have had enough of East London, I do not see growth for myself here (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 5 stated the following:

I do not think East London is much of a city campus. There are no places to cater for student life. As an opinion, I suggest that the city could add more sporting facilities and open some of the existing ones to students. I also suggest that the city and the

university should join hands to improve city campus life for students. Once I am done with my studies, I intend to move away from East London (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 6 stated the following:

There is really nothing interesting about the campus. A city where there is a common place for all varsity students in East London to meet beside the library, a place where we can walk freely without thinking about thieves but that is inevitable. The university should listen to the demands of the students because at the end of the day the university management themselves are parents. I do see myself settling in this city because everything that I need is all in one place and for financial reasons of course (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 7 stated the following:

There is nothing attractive about the elements of this city campus. It is unattractive because it does not presents students with much of an opportunity to experience a proper university life. The ideal city for students has to be a city that provides students with education only, but also a social life. I do not see myself settling in East London in the future, I want to settle down in a city that will provide my children with better opportunities than East London can (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 8 stated the following:

The building is the only attractive element for this campus. The most unattractive is the service you receive when needing help. Ideal city for students is East London. What can be done is they should have more hands on facilities for students to participate in. students should appreciate what they have and not vandalize property. I foresee myself settling in this city, I enjoy the small city vibe and how easy it is to get around (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 9 stated the following:

There is not really anything attractive about the campus because firstly it is not even situated in the same area, you will find some lecture venue are apart from each other in between other business or organizations. What would be the ideal city for students is if the buildings of the university would be in one area which would have enough space to accommodate sports and recreation facilities, learning centres, the library and everything else for ease of access without fearing to move from one place to the other because the others are exactly in town where there are thieves and robbers. The city and the university should come together to see how they can make the city student friendly and students should ensure that their views are always heard and make the managements in place see the need for these improvements to take place. I would settle in the town in the future as part of the working class, it is quite a reasonable for someone who is working as there are many companies and organizations for offer opportunities and it is also a chilled and relaxed place (09/09/2017).

Interviewee 10 stated the following:

I like the city of East London because it is accessible to town, it's exposed to many distractive places. A city should be one which promotes education and open mindedness and provide students with facilities in which they can do practical stuff

regarding their degrees in that way they will be kept busy. Also provide them with programs in facilities which promote education. Yes I would settle in East London, it's a beautiful place and convenient place to live in (09/09/2017).

According to IOL (2007), the then University of Fort Hare Vice-Chancellor Derrick Swartz said he aimed to make East London the newest student city in South Africa with a plan to expand the UFH campus around the Central Business District (CBD). Swartz stated: "our aim is to create a globally connected city. East London is the only medium-sized city in South Africa without an in-house city campus. This is a prerequisite for all major cities in the world" (IOL, 2007). The University of Fort Hare had plans to integrate their buildings with the city and to develop and renovate buildings surrounding its city campus into businesses like pharmacies, coffee shops and banks for the students (IOL, 2007). Fast forward 10 years and it is clear that this ideal has yet to come into fruition with students still feeling like East London is not a vibrant student city.

4.10 University of Fort Hare Management/Staff on the Fees Must Fall Movement at Fort Hare

For this study the researcher interviewed two members of the University of Fort Hare management, as well as four academic members of staff to see how the Fees Must Fall movement affected them. All the respondents share common sentiments that students' violent behavior has brought the name of the university into disrepute and it also set the university back financially, making it even more difficult for them to meet student demands. The respondents all shared the opinion that students should try and practice patience as these grievances that they have listed will not be addressed overnight as Fort Hare does not have ready funds available to cater to every need in such a short time frame. They caution students to be realistic in their demands.

When asked if they think the issue of free education is feasible an academic member of staff responded as follows:

Students cannot expect to receive a free education, where on this earth is a service rendered without the service provider being compensated? (11/09/2017)

When asked if they think the issue of free education is feasible a member of the University of Fort Hare management responded as follows:

Who will fund this free education? The government? Using what funds? To me it doesn't make sense, these students are just over zealous and some are opportunists trying to push their political agenda (11/09/2017).

As members of the University of Fort Hare management the respondents responded as follows on the issue of student grievances and the Fees Must Fall movement:

The fees issue is not only the responsibility of the university as the university feels that this is the government's responsibility as the government keeps making all these free education promises and failing to see them through. This proves to be a challenge for universities as it adds unnecessary pressure on them to account for the government's promises. Students are misdirecting their anger and frustration by destroying infrastructure and the university does not have the funds to repair the damaged property. Students want a whole host of issues (ranging from Wi-Fi to transport to residences) to be addressed all at once and this is simply impossible. Addressing student grievances will take time and will not happen overnight because fixing these issues involves money and the university does not have ready funds to address everything. The expression of issues is a problematic one because students become violent. Once they are violent we view them as a threat and it will not be easy for us to be approachable towards them when they set us back financially by destroying university property. During the Fees Must Fall Movement students displayed criminal and unruly behavior and we as the management of the University of Fort Hare do not support damage to property as a means to finding solutions to problems. Destruction of property will only make the situation worse as even more funds will be taken away from the university to repair damage (11/09/2017).

As academic members of staff, a lecturer at the University of Fort Hare stated the following on how the Fees Must Fall movement affected them as educators:

Students missed lectures during the Fees Must Fall movement; they damaged infrastructure; they disrupted the academic calendar resulting in exams having to be shifted and important lessons being missed and they disrupted the city life as these protests inconvenienced me as I recall being late for work on numerous occasions as they were burning tyres in the streets of Quigney as part of demonstrations which were being held and as a result of this roads were closed and I had to take a detour which disrupted the flow of traffic. We lived in fear of our lives as well as our personal possessions such as our cars as at one point students pelted them with stones. I spent my time and energy preparing for classes as someone who loves their job only to have my classes cancelled due to these protests and this was very disheartening and demotivating. Having observed these students in action I felt that these students were an embarrassment and were bringing the name of the University of Fort Hare into disrepute by behaving like violent hooligans and vigilantes. How do they expect people to sympathize with them when they are violent and display violent tendencies and behaviour which is reminiscent of the turbulent times of apartheid? The issue of Fees Must Fall at the University of Fort Hare is a very sensitive one. How can one not get emotional when they speak about it? The Fees Must Fall movement made me see that the university seriously needs to invest in security, well-trained security that can tackle any situation and keep everyone safe. Some lecturers were threatened because their students failed as a result of non-attendance of lectures and non-submission of assignments as some saw this period as a holiday. Fees Must Fall for me is an event I would like to forget (11/09/2017).

When asked if the Fees Must Fall protests were justified, a member of the University of Fort Hare management responded as follows:

If students had conducted themselves in a peaceful and reasonable manner then yes, but the fact that they acted violently has cast a shadow over their grievances. We believe that students have a right to air their grievances but only in a respectful and peaceful manner. Students could have protested peacefully and handing over a memorandum to management instead of leaving a trail of destruction that the university will have to clean up (11/09/2017).

When asked what could be done to address student grievances, a member of the University of Fort Hare management responded as follows:

Measures have been put in place to try and remedy the situation but it is still at infancy stage and it would be premature of us to divulge that information at this stage (11/09/2017).

When asked how the community of East London felt about the protests, a member of UFH staff responded as follows:

The university received plenty of complaints from members of the community who expressed their anger at how violent and disruptive the protests were. During this period of unrest members of the community had their property and cars damaged and also had to endure being physically intimidated by angry mobs of students. Members of the community were angry that they had to pay for damages to their belongings out of their own pockets and that they did not receive compensation. This period was a very bad time for Fort Hare's public image as we were receiving bad publicity and media coverage nationwide (11/09/2017).

When asked if the university has a plan to prevent future protests and if the university will engage with other stakeholder to address student grievances, a member of the UFH staff responded as follows:

No concrete deal is on the table at the moment but the university definitely believes that it cannot function as an island in order to address student needs (11/09/2017).

When asked if the university has a plan to prevent future protests and if the university will engage with other stakeholders to address student grievances, a member of UFH management responded as follows:

We believe that a healthy and mutually beneficial relationship between the university, business and the city of East London is necessary. In order to avoid this happening in the future the university will try its level best to prioritize the needs of students and make them more involved in decisions that will affect them personally (11/09/2017).

From the study it is clear to note that the Fees Must Fall movement affected people from all walks of life.

4.11 Conclusion

One thing has remained a popular sentiment is that at the core of students' demands has been a demand for the right to recognition and the right to the services they are entitled to enjoy as paying students and citizens. Many students come from lower middle class households and rely on government loans, grants and subsidies to support their studies, so some of the costs of their education are deferred, and not immediately borne by the students and their families as debts are accumulated. These accumulated debts prevent them from getting their marks and from registering. This is one reason for their anger. Another point of frustration for students is the fact that the environment they live in their host city is no less different than the areas they left back home.

These potential future leaders of the region and city should be nurtured and granted simple benefits such as: safe living environments; adequate recreation and sports facilities; proper libraries and studying facilities; access to student centres and attractive meeting places in public places; coffee shops and bookstores and cheap and safe public transport.

CHAPTER FIVE

Presenting of Research Findings

5.1 Introduction

This chapter will present all the research findings from this study under the following themes: beyond fees: other grievances; indebted students and the right to education; the promise and expectations of free education; commission findings on the University of Fort Hare and the conclusion.

5.2 Beyond Fees: Other Grievances

The study found that there were other student grievances beyond the issue of fees. The researcher initially thought that the Fees Must Fall movement was strictly about fees but discovered upon doing her research that fees was not the only issue and other issues included, firstly, students believe that they have a right to free education as students in a democratic country; secondly, students believe that the post-1994 government made a promise of free education that has not been fulfilled and, lastly, students were complaining that due to them having taken out loans during their duration of study they will not get a chance to enjoy the money they will work hard for once they get jobs. This is a stressful factor for them and their money is spent before they have earned it as they work their fingers to the bone to settle debts.

What most respondents alluded to is connected to the outcomes of the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training. According to the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training (2017) the South African higher education sector was unsettled by protests across the country in 2015. What characterised the 2015 protests from those which had taken place before was the fact that the protests were now taking place at historically-white universities (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017). Since 2000 the majority of frequent protests which took place were focused at the historically-black universities where the pertinent issues they were raising included the following: access to the National Financial Aid Scheme (NSFAS) and student accommodation needs and fees (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017).

The South African Union of Students (SAUS) is made up of Student Representative Council (SRC) Presidents from most of the universities in South Africa (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017). In order to clarify their view on

the demand for free education, SAUS made both a presentation and submission to the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017).

SAUS explained that they believe that free education will help to achieve social justice and transformation:

> They argued that charging fees is against the spirit of the Freedom Charter of 1955, and that the vast majority of South Africans support the demand for free education and identify with the aspirations of the Freedom Charter. SAUS explained further that the fight is not just for free education, but for decolonized free and quality education - a total overhaul of the current system that is inherently exploitative and exclusionary. Exclusion is not only on financial grounds, but also on academic and emotional levels. Thus, a restructuring is needed to ensure student success. SAUS was of the opinion that institutions have allowed education and learning to be commodified, meaning that people get the education that they can afford not the education that they deserve. It has become a marketable service which the student pays for, rather than an academic project. According to them, the focus has shifted towards accumulating credits at a certain cost, rather than on teaching and learning. In summary, SAUS explained that the demand is for the decolonisation of the education system; the de-commodification of higher education; curriculum review; broader transformation of the sector; the eradication of structural issues and the defeating of institutional autonomy; together with free quality education for the missing middle and the poor. The missing middle is explained as those that are not middle-class students, these are students from the working class who are too rich for NSFAS, and too poor to pay fees: too poor to be rich, and too rich to be poor. They are the children of teachers, of police men, of civil servants and others (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017:17&18).

The study revealed that the students are not just fighting for free education but also for a quality and decolonised free education. Students maintain that the current education system is exclusionary (financially and academically) and exploitative and needs to be remodelled to accommodate students from all walks of life and give students a sense of belonging in order to ensure their success.

5.3 Indebted Students and the Right to Education

From information gathered for this study most respondents alluded to the need for a right to education in order to forge better lives for themselves and join the working class of South Africa. Many of the respondents have their families' hopes and dreams pinned on their shoulders as most of them are the first to attain a tertiary qualification in their families and many do not get to see this dream come to fruition as they are

obstructed by student debt and have to drop out or end up not receiving their results or not being able to register for the next academic year.

What my respondents alluded to is connected to the outcomes of the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training which will be narrated below:

One of the outcomes of the Fees Must Fall movement was the establishment of the Presidential Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training on the 14th of January 2016 (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017). The Commission was tasked with "making recommendations on the feasibility of making higher education and training fee-free in South Africa" (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017:20). One can therefore note that the tertiary education sector has been impacted in a major way by subsequent decisions about funding and the Fees Must Fall protests. Even though the effects of the Fees Must Fall movement have been different across the board, one thing that is certain is the fact that these effects have been felt by all:

> The financial impact of the protests was profound. For students, it meant no fee increase for 2016 and either a reduced or no fee increase for 2017, depending on the student's income bracket. All students, no matter their household income, benefited from the 2016 decision. For the government, R16.2 billion was reprioritised into university baseline funding and NSFAS from across government for the Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) (to fund unfunded poor students through NSFAS and the effect of the 0% fee increase in 2016 and its carry through effect over 3 years). The NSFAS allocation for historic debt was R2.543bn; and additional funding for students to continue was R2.039bn. This resulted in an additional funding allocation of R9.2bn for NSFAS over the MTEF period. This will be an ongoing cost into the foreseeable future. The cost of the 2017 government funding of zero percent for all those from households with an income of less than R600 000 is yet to be determined, as the number of students falling into this category is unknown. It is expected that about 75% of students will need to be covered (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017:21).

According to the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training (2017) there is still a shortage of funds to cover all qualifying students regardless of the fact that NSFAS funding has been increased. For the universities, this means increased financial strain. Severe financial pressure was already put on many institutions as a result of the rapid rising of student numbers and costs increasing at above inflation rates which meant that subsidy increases were too low (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017).

According to the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training (2017) for many years to come the zero percent fee increase which was announced for the 2016 academic year will have an impact on institutions in the sense that any possible future fee increases will be on a reduced fee base. Furthermore, institutions face the further burden of non-payment of fees and historic student debt (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017). "Institutions explained to the Commission that debt was a problem for their sustainability, and that in the wake of the protests, fewer students were paying their fees" (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017:22).

With that being said one can therefore deduce that the high levels of debt can possibly be indicative of the fact that many students simply cannot afford to pay their fees. South Africa is faced with a major student funding crisis and universities are under pressure to include more students and keep their fees low. The current government student funding scheme which is NSFAS doesn't cover all students in need and is unsustainable. Perhaps an alternative student funding model should be created and adopted, one that will work for South Africa and the greater African continent.

5.4 The Promise and Expectations: Free Education?

Most respondents alluded to the need for free education at tertiary institutions in South Africa. The reasons that they cited was that education should be a basic human right and that their opinions were founded on the Freedom Charter and the Constitution. Students go to universities in order to increase their opportunities in the job market and it is for this reason that the respondents further stated that they believe that the state should be involved in subsidising or offering free education.

The findings of this study indicate that most respondents would rather have free tertiary education in South Africa because they can barely afford the fees and accommodation. What my respondents alluded to is connected to the outcomes of the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training which are noted below:

The Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training (2017) stated that the White Paper (1997) considers the following as the purpose of higher education:

> Higher education plays a central role in the social, cultural and economic development of modern societies. In South Africa today, the challenge is to redress past inequalities and to transform the higher education system to serve a new social order, to meet pressing national needs, and to respond

> to new realities and opportunities. It must lay the foundations for the development of a learning society which can stimulate, direct and mobilise the creative and intellectual energies of all the people towards meeting the challenge of reconstruction and development (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017:34).

According to the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training (2017) one of the main focus areas of the Commission's work has been to better understand the reasons for the demand for free education; the Constitutional obligations; and the government's policy in this regard. The 1955 Freedom Charter was used as a benchmark for many individuals who were fighting for and demanding free education (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017).

The Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training (2017) states that the Freedom Charter of 1955 was considered to be the blueprint for a democratic, post-apartheid South Africa in historical terms. While not detracting from its historical and political significance, the Freedom Charter is not a legal document and does not form part of the South African law (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017).

According to the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training (2017:108 & 109) the Freedom Charter states that:

The Doors Of Learning And Of Culture Shall Be Opened!

- *The government shall discover, develop and encourage national talent for the enhancement of our cultural life;*
- *All the cultural treasures of mankind shall be open to all, by free exchange of books, ideas and contact with other lands;*
- *The aim of education shall be to teach the youth to love their people and their culture, to honour human brotherhood, liberty and peace;*
- *Education shall be free, compulsory, universal and equal for all children;*
- *Higher education and technical training shall be opened to all by means of state allowances and scholarships awarded on the basis of merit;*
- *Adult illiteracy shall be ended by a mass state education plan;*
- *Teachers shall have all the rights of other citizens;*
- *The colour bar in cultural life, in sport and in education shall be abolished.*

The Freedom Charter document refers to free, compulsory basic education for all children. "However, when referring to higher and technical education it does not refer to free education, but rather to state allowances and scholarships, which are awarded based on merit. The Charter does not explain merit in this context. It can be taken to mean that state allowances and scholarships should only be provided to the best performing students" (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017:109).

According to the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training (2017) the commissioners are satisfied that the Freedom Charter did not address the question of fee-free higher education. Its emphasis seems rather to have been on access and merit.

While the Freedom Charter was a document often referred to, it is the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, which determines the state's obligations in terms of higher education and training. The Constitution deals with education in section 29 (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017:110 &111):

(1) Everyone has the right:

(a) to a basic education, including adult basic education; and

(b) to further education, which the state, through reasonable measures, must make progressively available and accessible.

(2) Everyone has the right to receive education in the official language or languages of their choice in public educational institutions where that education is reasonably practicable. In order to ensure the effective access to, and implementation of, this right, the state must consider all reasonable educational alternatives, including single medium institutions, taking into account:

(a) equity;

(b) practicability; and

(c) the need to redress the results of past racially discriminatory laws and practices.

> The Constitution states through reasonable measures, must make progressively available and accessible. It does not refer to free education, and

> does not indicate the progressive realisation of free education. The focus is not on the policy used (such as the preferred financial aid intervention) to ensure the right, but on the right itself. Therefore, if increased access and availability would be ensured through a different or changed funding model, this would be progressive in meeting the Constitutional requirements. As such, policy changes away from free education could be introduced should these meet the Constitutional demand for higher education to be progressively [made] available and accessible. It must, however, be borne in mind that higher education and training must be accessible to individuals from all financial backgrounds (Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training, 2017:116).

The study revealed that most students call for free education for all and they argue that they were promised free higher education by the government and that the government has not delivered. However, the wealthiest sections of society would be further advantaged if free education was implemented: the quality of public higher education would be severely compromised and the poor would in turn subsidise the rich. Evidence suggests that highly developed and wealthy countries which have a large tax base are the only countries that can afford to offer free higher education.

5.5 Commission Findings on the University of Fort Hare

Based on information gathered for this study most respondents who are students of the University of Fort Hare stated the following as shortcomings of the University of Fort Hare: poor security on campus; finance office needs to be improved as the service is poor and slow; poorly equipped library; residences are in a poor condition, have insufficient space and are expensive; lack of student centre for students to unwind and maintain a healthy work-life balance; lack of adequate computer laboratories and computers and lack of fitness centre and sports grounds.

What my respondents alluded to is connected to the outcomes of the Commission's findings on the University of Fort Hare which are shared below:

Figure 1. 1. Extract from the Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training

The University of Fort Hare (UFH) began by explaining that, as a Historically Disadvantaged Institution (HDI), they experienced serious underfunding, which in turn led to backlogs in infrastructure and equipment for teaching and learning, research, staff and student accommodation, transport etc. In this way, the university highlighted how a lack of money was affecting the quality of the education the institution could provide. The UFH referred to and critiqued the post-apartheid funding formula and the recent funding review. They also indicated that there is no national decision to fund higher education in an amount related to a percentage of the Gross Domestic Product. As a result of this there are varied unplanned proportions of funding compared to Gross Domestic Product (GDP) over years. As a result of the decline in funding the institutions have been increasing fees to match the requisite need for quality higher education. For HDIs, whose majority of students come from poor families, this has led to high demands for the National Student Financial Aid Scheme (NSFAS) to provide more funding. The lack of matching increases in NSFAS funding has led to increased student debt. The UFH went into some more detail regarding underfunding for both university quality development and students. UFH indicated that, in their view, Fees should be a component of higher education funding but the poor should access higher education without having to pay at the point of service. The students supported by the state should pay back after qualifying, either in kind or in cash. Public service in various spheres of government is one option. This needs proper Human Resource (HR) planning so that the public service is not bloated in the end.

The University of Fort Hare is classified as a HDI. Its evidence in the main demonstrates the differences in funding HDI's and Historically Advantaged Institutions (HAI's). For example, external donors funded 1 394 students in 2016, to the value of R77 336 715 million, compared to the R189 303 million that was received by the University of the Witwatersrand for external bursaries in the same year. It must be born in mind that the student population of UFH was about 13 500, whilst students attending the University of the Witwatersrand numbered about 34 000. Most of the students at Fort Hare are supported by NSFAS. NSFAS allocated R864 050 562 million to Fort Hare to fund 9 059 students in 2016. The NSFAS allocation for Wits for the same year was almost half that, at R463 586 million. We note that these NSFAS allocations for both Fort Hare and Wits distort the actual NSFAS allocation because they include the amounts allocated for historic debt and the Kgodisano allocations. NSFAS funding also makes up the majority of student funding at the University of KwaZulu-Natal (UKZN), constituting 67.78% of student funding income. External bursaries amounted to R158 988 462. UKZN's internal funding sources amounted to R168 285 480,568 while Wits had R262 277 000 of internal funds for disbursement (a difference of about R94 million). As the evidence suggests, HDIs are less able to raise third stream income with the result that they have limited funding from this income stream to support students. Their capacity to top up any NSFAS grants or to fund postgraduate students is therefore equally constrained. Cross subsidisation within an

institution is not possible when the student population is largely within or below the missing middle.

Source: Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training (2017:172 & 391).

From the study it is clear that the University of Fort Hare has experienced a serious problem of underfunding which has plagued it for a number of years. The problem of underfunding therefore led to backlogs in: staff and student accommodation; equipment and infrastructure for learning and teaching; and transport and research. The lack of money therefore affects the quality of life and education that it can provide to students and this needs a serious overhaul in order to address student needs.

5.6 The Threat of Crime and Lack of Recreational facilities in East London

Based on the study most students resoundingly felt that they did not feel safe in the city of East London. Students expressed that they did not feel safe walking to or from campus whether it is during the day or night time. They stressed that their academic work suffers as they would rather not go on campus to utilise the library and the computer laboratories at night as they fear getting robbed of their possessions. Students stated that they are dissatisfied with the fact that residences do not have Wi-Fi where they can do their academic work in the comfort of their rooms and work as well with fellow classmates who reside at residence.

Students stated that the areas which they deem as most dangerous and unsafe are Southernwood and Quigney. The alarming fact is that the majority of students reside in these two areas either in private accommodation or residences putting them at high risk to be victims of criminal activity. Students unanimously suggested that the University of Fort Hare introduce shuttles for students to take them from campus to their accommodation and that there be an increase in police visibility and the creation of community policing forums.

Students are crippled by fear as crime is very rampant where they reside. Students who reside in residence also suggested that security be tightened there as there are high incidents of crime and theft in residence. Students called for stricter and tighter measures of signing in and Closed-Circuit Television video surveillance systems to deter crime. Recreational facilities is also an area which students feel needs to be improved. Students suggested that the university create: a student hub where they

can relax outside of the classroom; a varsity fitness centre and sports grounds where students can freely participate in sports.

5.7 Conclusion

From the findings of the Commission and the researcher's own information that was gathered for this study one can therefore note that HDIs like Fort Hare are less able to raise third stream income with the result that they have limited funding from this income stream to support students. Their capacity to top up any NSFAS grants or to fund postgraduate students is therefore equally constrained. Cross subsidisation within an institution is not possible when the student population is largely within or below the missing middle.

Without funding students' issues cannot be addressed. Most students raised various points of concern in relation to their studies at UFH. Some of the main concerns bordered around unaffordability of university education since most students are from poor families that are struggling financially. It also became clear that there were other additional issues that angered students such as: the poor standard of the student accommodation; lack of security; lack of university transport; inability to access Wi-Fi; increasing crime and lack of adequate recreation facilities.

CHAPTER SIX

Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations

6.1 Summary

In 2015, South Africa went through a state of turmoil in its higher education institutions when students started protesting nationwide against issues that they felt were bothering them at their institutions. The main issue which was highlighted and was a common grievance amongst students was that of increasing fees which students were against. They instead advocated for free, decolonised and accessible education. Students stood in solidarity and engaged in protests across the country and this movement became known as the Fees Must Fall movement. The main objective of this study was to examine issues which led to students' disgruntlement and not only focus on the fees aspect but also the underlying issues that were not given much attention. This study used the University of Fort Hare in East London as a case study.

The Fees Must Fall movement sent shockwaves around the country and brought the plight of students to the forefront. Bringing this closer to home in the Quigney, East London disgruntled students from the University of Fort Hare showed their discontent by emptying litter bins into the street, burning tyres, looting bookshops, destroying property and stoning vehicles. This very behaviour has gone on to grab national headlines and spark a national debate for the past two years. This research aimed to dissect the core issues of the Fees Must Fall movement and help better understand the students' reasoning behind it. At the core of students' demands has been a demand for the right to recognition and the right to the services they are entitled to enjoy as paying students and citizens.

6.2 Conclusions

The University of Fort Hare is considered a HDI which has been plagued by a history of protests by students. However, the Fees Must Fall movement has made inroads towards change as a zero percent fee increase was announced for both the 2016 and 2017 academic year at UFH. With that being said, however, plenty of work still needs to be done in order to address several other underlying issues which students have been grappling with in order to ensure that they have an enjoyable and positive student experience at the University. The Fees Must Fall movement played an important role

in highlighting issues which the university might not have been aware of and now this gives the university an opportunity to respond accordingly to the challenges and grievances that students brought forward.

The findings of the study indicated that most students that enrol at the universities are from families that are struggling financially and hence are unable to cope with the increasing demand of university education. The government on the other hand has not fully committed to promising free education for all. Most students were therefore troubled by the fact that they would be heavily indebted by the time they complete their studies, hence their participation in the Fees Must Fall movement.

Additional grievances were also pointed out and these included: poor accommodation standards; lack of sporting facilities; crime; security; transport; access to Wi-Fi; inadequate academic facilities and lack of recreational facilities.

6.3 Recommendations

One can note that it is vital for businesses and UFH to partner with each other to form a mutually beneficial relationship. Universities provide businesses with a skilled array of potential employees and businesses should therefore protect and nurture that by investing money into UFH in order to ensure that students who are also citizens are well taken care of and their interests are catered for. If this is done students will be more encouraged to stay in their host city and work here and plough back some money into the city versus moving away and finding employment out of the city.

In addition it is essential that UFH addresses the issue of security as many students do not feel safe in the city. To address this issue of security UFH and the city of East London need to look at different avenues. There should be visibility of metro police in students' vicinities. This might lower the insecurities that students feel when they roam in the city. Another option, UFH should work with Buffalo City Metro, where the city might help students with transport since the city owns some buses.

Recreational facilities are vital to lure young people to a city. Therefore it is important that Buffalo City and UFH work together in creating a conducive environment for students. It is essential that these stakeholders work together to build student centres as these facilities are important for students.

For many students the Fees Must Fall movement meant progressing towards achieving an ultimate goal which is free education in South Africa. In addition, this movement is a relief for students who are from disadvantaged families where their parents find it difficult to pay their current debts. The Fees Must Fall movement did not only have an impact on students but also the South African community at large as students come from families which are part of this community.

REFERENCES

Acharya, A. S., Prakash, A., Saxena, P., & Nigam, A. (2013). Sampling: Why and how of it. *Indian Journal of Medical Specialties*, *4*(2), 330-333.

Babbie, E. & Mouton, J. 2006. *The Practice of Social Research: South African Edition.* Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Babbie, E. & Mouton, J. 2011. *The Practice of Social Research.* Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Badat, S. 2016. *Deciphering the Meanings and Explaining the South African Higher Education Student Protests of 2015-16.* http://wiser.wits.ac.za/system/files/documents/Saleem%20Badat%20-%20Deciphering%20the%20Meanings,%20and%20Explaining%20the%20South%20African%20Higher%20Education%20Student%20Protests.pdf (Accessed 20 February 2017).

Benneworth, P. C. D. 2010. *Building Localized Interactions between Universities and Cities through University Spatial Development, European Planning Studies*, http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09654313.2010.504345. (Accessed 05 May 2017).

Bless, C., Higson-Smith, C., & Kagee, A. 2006. *Fundamentals of Social Research Methods – An African Perspective.* 4th Edition. Cape Town: Juta.

Booysen, S. 2016. *Fees Must Fall: Student Revolt, Decolonisation and Governance in South Africa.* Johannesburg: Wits University Press.

Branch, A., & Mampilly, Z. 2015. *Africa Uprising: Popular Protest and Political Change.* London: Zed Books Ltd.

Bromley, A. 2000. *Teacher Turnover: Examining Exit Attrition, Teaching Area Transfer and School Migration. Exceptional Children* 75(1), 7-31.

Bulmer, M. 1982. *Social Research Ethics.* London: The Macmillan Press.

Cassim, Y. 2015. *DA Calls for End to Student Housing Exploitation at Fort Hare University.* https://www.da.org.za/2015/04/da-calls-for-end-to-student-housing-exploitation-at-fort-hare-university/ (Accessed 29 July 2016).

Cloete, N., Maasen, P., Fehnel, R., Moja, T., Perold, H., & Gibbon, T. 2004. *Transformation in Higher Education: Global Pressures and Local Realities in South Africa.* https://chet.org.za/download/file/fid/103 (Accessed 03 March 2017).

Cloete, N. 2016. *'Free' University Favours the Rich.* Daily Dispatch (30/09/2016).

Clough, P. & Nutbrown, C. 2007. *A Student's Guide to Methodology.* 2nd Edition. London: Sage Publications.

Cohen, L. & Manion, L. 2007. *Research Methods in Production.* New York: Taylor and Francis Group.

Commission of Inquiry into Higher Education and Training. 2017. *Report of the Commission of Enquiry into Higher Education and Training to the President of the Republic of South Africa.* http://www.thepresidency.gov.za/sites/default/files/Commission%20of%20Inquiry%20into%20Higher%20Education%20Report.pdf (Accessed 14 November 2017).

Cresswell, J. W. 2008. *Educational Research, Planning, Conducting and Evaluating Qualitative Research.* 3rd Edition. Upper Saddle River: Pearson.

Cresswell, J.W. 2009. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches.* 3rd Edition. Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Davids, N. & Waghid, Y. 2016. *#FeesMustFall: History of South African Student Protests Reflects Inequality's Grip.* https://mg.co.za/article/2016-10-10-feesmustfall-history-of-south-african-student-protests-reflects-inequalitys-grip (Accessed 05 February 2017).

Denzin, N. K. & Lincoln, Y. S. 1998. *Collecting and Interpreting Qualitative Materials.* In Rudestam, J.E. & Newton, R.R. (Eds.). *Surviving Your Dissertation: A Comprehensive Guide to Content and Process.* 2nd Edition. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications Inc.

Denzin, N. K. & Lincoln, Y. S. 2005. *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research.* London: Sage Publications.

Deutsch, M., & Cook, S. 1961. Research Methods in Social Relations with Special References to Prejudice. New York: Dryden Press.

Duderstadt, J., Taggart, J. & Weber, L. 2008. *The Globalisation of Higher Education,* pp. 273-290. London: Economica.

Flick, U. 2011. *Introducing Research Methodology: A Beginner's Guide to doing a Research Project.* London: Sage Publications.

Hall, M. 2016. *Why Are South African Students So Angry?* (Available Online) http://www.bbc.com/news/business-35883919 (Accessed 29/08/2017).

Hall, M. 2016. *South Africa's Student Protests Have Lessons for All Universities*, https://www.theguardian.com/higher-education-network/2016/mar/03/south-africas-student-protests-have-lessons-for-all-universities (Accessed 03/04/2016).

Harvey, D. 2005. *A Brief History of Neoliberalism.* Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Iol. 2007. *University's Plan to Revitalise East London.* https://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/universitys-plan-to-revitalise-east-london-313544 (Accessed 03 February 2016).

John Hopkins University. 2013. *School-Life Balance.* http://jhsap.org/self_help_resources/school-life_balance/index.html (Accessed 03 August 2016).

Langa, M. 2016. *#Hashtag – An Analysis of the #FeesMustFall Movement at South African Universities.* Johannesburg: Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation. http://www.csvr.org.za/pdf/An-analysis-of-the-FeesMustFall-Movement-at-South-African-universities.pdf (Accessed 05/07/2017).

Madasa, S. 2016. *The Responsibility of Being a Student at the University of Fort Hare.* http://www.activateleadership.co.za/blog/the-responsibility-of-being-a-student-at-the-university-of-fort-hare (Accessed 27 October 2016).

Makgoba, K. 2016. *Social Media Activism – Fees Must Fall.* http://chica.co.za/career/social-media-activism-feesmustfall/ (Accessed 25 January 2017).

Malhotre, N.K. 2004. *Marketing Research: An Applied Orientation.* 4th Edition. India: Pearson Education.

Maree, K. 2008. *First Steps in Research.* Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Masila, V. 2016. *#FeesMustFall is just the start of change, University fees tie in with far broader social and educational issues we have hardly begun to address, such as the indigenisation of knowledge*, Mail and Guardian (20/01/2016). https://mg.co.za/article/2016-01-20-fees-are-just-the-start-of-change/ (Accessed 05 May 2016).

Massey, D. 2010. *Under Protest: The Rise of Student Resistance at the University of Fort Hare.* Pretoria: Unisa Press.

Maykut, P. & Morehouse, R. 1994. *Beginning Qualitative Research: A Philosophic and Practical Guide.* London: The Falmer Press.

Mcmilan, J.H. & Schumacher, S. 2006. *Research in Education Evidence Based Inquiry.* 6th Edition. New York: Virginia Commonwealth University.

Memela, S. 2016. *Fort Hare Is Not What It Used To Be.* http://m.thoughtleader.co.za/sandilememela/2016/02/12/fort-hare-is-not-what-it-is-used-be/?wpmp_switcher=mobile (Accessed 06/04/2016).

Miller, T., Mauthner, M., Birch, M., & Jessop, J. 2002. *Ethics in Qualitative Research.* London: Sage Publications.

Morken, B. 2015. *South Africa: The Meaning of the #FeesMustFallMovement. https://www.marxist.com/meaning-of-the-feesmustfall-movement.htm (Accessed 16 February 2017).*

Ndlovu-Gatsheni, S.J. 2016. *Why Are South African Universities Sites of Struggle Today?* The Thinker, Volume 70.

Ngcaweni, B. 2015. *#FeesMustFall: Many South Africans are behind the students,* Daily Maverick (21/10/2015). http://www.dailymaverick.co.za/opinionista/2015-10-21-feesmustfall-many-south-africans-are-behind-the-students/#.WEGkbLVXeEe (Accessed 01 November 2016).

Nini, A. & Daymani, M. 2017. *EC Has Highest Murder Rate*, Daily Dispatch (25/10/2017). http://www.dispatchlive.co.za/featured/2017/10/25/ec-highest-murder-rate/ (Accessed 01 November 2017).

Nyanda, S. 2016. *Rioting UFH Students in Court.* Daily Dispatch (13/10/2016). http://www.google.co.za/amp/www.dispatchlive.co.za/news/2016/10/13/rioting-ufh-students-court/amp/?client=safari (Accessed 29/08/2016).

Parliamentary Monitoring Group. 2014. *Student Protests: University of Fort Hare Briefing, 10 September 2014, University of Fort Hare*. http://pmg.org.za/committee-meeting/17525/ (Accessed 08 November 2016).

Phandle, G. 2016. *Fort Hare Centenary Toasts Proud Legacy*, Daily Dispatch (08/02/2016).http://www.google.co.za/amp/www.dispatchlive.co.za/news/2016/02/08/fort-hare-centenary-toasts-proud-legacy/amp/?client=safari (Accessed 03/03/2016)

Powers, G.T. 2000. *Practice Focused: Integrating Human Service Practice and Research.* New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Tandwa, L. 2016. *Protests, Speeches as Fort Hare Celebrates 100 Years.* https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/protests-speeches-as-fort-hare-celebrates-100-years-20160521 (Accessed 03/11/2016).

Terreblanche, M., Durrrheim, K., & Painter, D. 1999. *Research in Practice: Applied Methods for the Social Sciences.* Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Tongai, I. 2013. *Classes Resume at Fort Hare after Protests.* University World News (23/02/2013) http://www.universityworldnews.com/article.php?story=20130222120815401 (Accessed 20 October 2016).

University of Fort Hare Official Website. No Date. http://www.ufh.ac.za/StudyUFH/Pages/SportUniversityFortHare.aspx (Accessed 27 May 2017).

University of Fort Hare Official Website. 2013. http://wvw.ufh.ac.za/?q=about-university/university-campuses (Accessed 01 March 2016).

Zuma, J. 2016. *Address for the Centenary Celebrations of the University of Fort Hare*, Sunday Times (20/05/2016). https://www.timeslive.co.za/sunday-times/news/2016-05-20-watch-live-mugabe-zuma-address-fort-hare-centenary-celebrations/ (Accessed 20 November 2016).

APPENDICES

Appendix 1 - Interview Guide for University of Fort Hare Students

University of Fort Hare
Together in Excellence

INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR STUDENTS AT THE UNIVERSITY OF FORT HARE

Name of interviewer: _____

Name of organisation: _____

Number of interviewee: _____

Place: _____

Time: _____

1. What year of study are you currently in at Fort Hare?
2. What course/programme are you currently studying?
3. Why did you choose Fort Hare as your institution of choice?
4. Which city or country are you from?
5. What is the value of your student debt if you have any debt?
6. How do you pay for your school fees?
7. How does your debt affect you, if you have any?
8. Were you aware of student funding opportunities at the University of Fort Hare?
9. What other grievances apart from fees do you feel need to be addressed by the University of Fort Hare?
10. What role do you feel financial challenges play in the Fees Must Fall movement?
11. Do you feel that education in tertiary institutions has transformed since apartheid according to your experience and opinion?
12. What are the possible causes of the Fees Must Fall protests?
13. Do you reside in residence or not?
14. If so, why did you choose to stay in the student residence?

15. What is your opinion of the state of the student residences?
16. In your opinion what could student residences improve on?
17. If you reside in private accommodation, how much do you spend on rent every month?
18. If you reside in residence, how much do you spend on residence every month?
19. What do you get up to socially on weekends to unwind outside of university?
20. What are your favourite hangout spots in the city centre?
21. Do you take part in any physical activity?
22. If so, where?
23. Do you consider your neighbourhood a safe place?
24. In your opinion how can crime be improved in residences as well as in the city of East London where students reside?
25. What is your personal take on the crime in the city of East London?
26. What is your opinion of the quality of your academic programmes at the University of Fort Hare?
27. What is your opinion of the quality of your on campus student facilities at the University of Fort Hare?
28. Does your neighbourhood have adequate recreational facilities for you?
29. Do you regard East London as a dynamic place for students?
30. How much money do you spend on groceries every month?
31. How much do you spend on transport every month?

Appendix 2 - Interview Guide for Members of the University of Fort Hare Student Representative Council

University of Fort Hare
Together in Excellence

INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR MEMBERS OF THE UNIVERSITY OF FORT HARE STUDENT REPRESENTATIVE COUNCIL (SRC)

Name of interviewer: _____

Name of organisation: _____

Number of interviewee: _____

Place: _____

Time: _____

1. What do you think is your role as an SRC member towards the University of Fort Hare?
2. What role do you feel you play within the University of Fort Hare?
3. What role do you feel the University of Fort Hare should play towards their students?
4. What does the Fees Must Fall movement mean to you?
5. How did you take part in the Fees Must Fall movement?
6. If you participated in the Fees Must Fall movement, why did you feel the need to participate?
7. Do you think the zero % fee increase adequately addresses the current student demands?

Appendix 3 – Interview Guide for University of Fort Hare Management/Staff

University of Fort Hare

Together in Excellence

INTERVIEW GUIDE FOR UNIVERSITY OF FORT HARE MANAGEMENT/STAFF

Name of interviewer: _____

Name of organisation: _____

Number of interviewee: _____

Place: _____

Time: _____

1. What does the Fees Must Fall movement mean to you?
2. What role do you feel the University of Fort Hare should play towards their students?
3. How did the Fees Must Fall protests affect your academic calendar?
4. How did you feel about the actions and behaviour of the University of Fort Hare students during the Fees Must Fall protests?
5. Did the Fees Must Fall protests affect you personally in any way?
6. Do you think the protest is justified?
7. What can be done to address student grievances?
8. How does the East London community feel about these protests?
9. Is the university engaging with other stakeholders on student wishes?
10. Does the university have a plan to prevent these protests from happening in the future?

Appendix 4 - Ethical Clearance Certificate

University of Fort Hare
Together in Excellence

ETHICAL CLEARANCE CERTIFICATE
REC-270710-028-RA Level 01

Certificate Reference Number:	SIB021SFAZ01
Project title:	**Student grievances at institutions of higher education and training in Post-Apartheid South Africa: The case study of fees must fall movement at the University of Fort Hare in East London.**
Nature of Project	Masters in African Studies
Principal Researcher:	Zandile Yolisa Fazzie
Supervisor:	Dr O Sibanda
Co-supervisor:	N/A

On behalf of the University of Fort Hare's Research Ethics Committee (UREC) I hereby give ethical approval in respect of the undertakings contained in the above-mentioned project and research instrument(s). Should any other instruments be used, these require separate authorization. The Researcher may therefore commence with the research as from the date of this certificate, using the reference number indicated above.

Please note that the UREC must be informed immediately of

- Any material change in the conditions or undertakings mentioned in the document
- Any material breaches of ethical undertakings or events that impact upon the ethical conduct of the research

Special conditions: Research that includes children as per the official regulations of the act must take the following into account:

Note: The UREC is aware of the provisions of s71 of the National Health Act 61 of 2003 and that matters pertaining to obtaining the Minister's consent are under discussion and remain unresolved. Nonetheless, as was decided at a meeting between the National Health Research Ethics Committee and stakeholders on 6 June 2013, university ethics committees may continue to grant ethical clearance for research involving children without the Minister's consent, provided that the prescripts of the previous rules have been met. This certificate is granted in terms of this agreement.

The UREC retains the right to

- Withdraw or amend this Ethical Clearance Certificate if
  - Any unethical principal or practices are revealed or suspected
  - Relevant information has been withheld or misrepresented
  - Regulatory changes of whatsoever nature so require
  - The conditions contained in the Certificate have not been adhered to

- Request access to any information or data at any time during the course or after completion of the project.

- In addition to the need to comply with the highest level of ethical conduct principle investigators must report back annually as an evaluation and monitoring mechanism on the progress being made by the research. Such a report must be sent to the Dean of Research's office

The Ethics Committee wished you well in your research.

Yours sincerely

Professor Lindelwa Majova-Songca
Acting Dean of Research

08 September 2017