

Declaration

I, Wendy Leigh Hartwig, declare that this is my own work and where I have used the ideas or words of others, I have acknowledged this.

Signed:_____ Date:_____

Abstract

The animal welfare legislation that is discussed in this Dissertation is just a sample of the available legislation from the chosen foreign jurisdictions and South Africa. The chosen foreign jurisdictions were chosen as a lens to gain a needed perspective on South African animal welfare legislation. The legislation chosen for discussion falls within particular categories that are discussed fully in the later chapters.ⁱ

Despite the fact that the animal rights and animal welfare movements are recorded to date back as far as 500B.C, the majority of jurisdictions throughout the world still consider animals to be property that can be bought, traded, hunted and after they are killed, their remains kept as trophies or souvenirs. Within these jurisdictions (which includes South Africa and the other four chosen foreign jurisdictions – Kenya, India, Switzerland and the United States of America) there is a demonstrated lack of proper enforcement of the animal welfare/animal anti-cruelty legislation, regulations and industry rules, which is made worse by the actions of uncaring, abusive and/or ignorant people.

South Africa is no better or worse to the four chosen jurisdictions in that it has similar anti-cruelty/animal welfare legislation. The lack of proper enforcement of this animal welfare legislation in South Africa should be of great concern as many studies have indicated that there is a link between animal abuse/cruelty and ‘human’ abuse. The same studies also indicate that animal abusers are at a greater risk of becoming violent criminals or of committing a violent crime. For example, the Federal Bureau of Investigation has noted that most serial killers in the USA had a history of torturing, abusing and killing animals before they moved on to torturing, abusing and/or killing humans in their adult life.

Needed changes to the animal welfare legislation and how people view animals should be made in South Africa to ensure that welfare of animals is protected. For example, the Government could educate people about animal welfare in order to overcome any ignorance that may be the cause of animal pain and abuse, as well as strengthening existing animal welfare legislation. The eradication of ignorance, as well as a necessary change in the current animal welfare legislation, will help to create a real change in how people view and treat

ⁱ Chapter 5 and 6.

animals. People will come to realise that animals exist in their own right and that they were not created to serve or to be exploited by man.

Acknowledgements

This thesis would not have been possible without the guidance, support and encouragement from my supervisors, Professor Boyce Wanda and Mr. Jacques Mahler-Coetzee.

Special thanks to my family and friends for their continued support in all that I do.

I would also like to give special thanks to Barbara Opperman for all the help she has given me throughout this process.

List of Abbreviations Used in This Work

AU - African Union

TGT Agreement - Agreement on Technical Barriers to Trade

ALDF - Animal Legal Defence Fund

ASEAN - Association of Southeast Asian Nations

BUAV - British Union for the Abolition of Vivisection

COK - Compassion over Killing

CoE - Council of Europe

CETS - Council of Europe Treaty Series

CITES – Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Fauna and Flora

Euratom - European Atomic Energy Community

EC - European Communities

EEC - European Economic Community

EU - European Union

FBI - Federal Bureau of Investigation

FAO - Food and Agricultural Organisation

GATT 1994 - General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

IAEA - International Atomic Energy Agency

ITO - International Trade Organisation

KWS - Wildlife Service

KWSTI - Kenya Wildlife Service Training Institute

NSPCA - National Council of Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals

OAS - Organisation of American States

OAU - Organisation of African Unity

OIC - Organization of the Islamic Conference

OSCE - Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe

PETA - People for the Ethical Treatment of Animals

RSPCA - Royal Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals

SPS Agreement - Sanitary and Phytosanitary Agreement

SPCA - Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals

SPALV - Society for the Protection of Animals Liable to Vivisection

SAARC - South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation

UN - United Nations

UNEP – United Nations Environment Programme

USDA - United States Department of Agriculture

FDA - United States of America Food and Drug Administration

UDAW - Universal Declaration on Animal Welfare

WTO - World Trade Organisation

WWF - World Wildlife Fund

Table of Cases Cited in This Dissertation

South African Cases

National Council of Societies for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals v Openshaw 2008 ZASCA 78 (RSA).

R v Heldberg 1993 NPD 507.

R v Moato 1947 (1) SA 490 (O).

R v Sibeko 1951 (2) SA (E).

S v Edmunds 1968 (2) PH H398 (N).

S v Gerwe 1977 (3) SA 1078 (T).

S v Nkhulmeleni 1986 (3) SA 102 (V).

Smit NO and others v King Goodwill Zwelithini Kabhekuzulu and others (10237/2009) Kwa-Zulu Natal High Court, Pietermaritzburg (Unreported).

Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals, Standerton v Nel & Others 1988 (4) SA 42 (W).

Indian Cases

Nair v Union of India, Kerala High Court No. 155/1999, June 2000 (Unreported).

United Kingdom Cases

Ford v Wiley (1889) 23QB 203.

United States of America Cases

Levine v Conner 540 F.Supp.2d 1113 (N.D. Cal. 2008).

Loggerhead Turtle v City Council 896 F Supp 1170 (MD Fla 1995).

Spotted Owl v Hodel, 716 F Supp 479 (WD Wash 1988).

Tree Boa v Witt 918 F Supp 879 (DVI 1996).

Table of Statutes

South African Statutes

The Animal Health Act 7 of 2002.

The Animals Protection Act 71 of 1962.

The Game Theft Act 105 of 1991.

The KwaZulu-Natal Nature Conservation Management Act 9 of 1997.

The Meat Safety Act 40 of 2000.

The National Environmental Management Act 107 of 1998.

The Nature and Environmental Conservation Ordinance 19 of 1974 (Cape).

The Nature Conservation Ordinance 15 of 1974 (Natal).

The Nature Conservation Ordinance 8 of 1969 (Orange Free State).

The Nature Conservation Ordinance 12 of 1983 (Transvaal).

The Performing Animals Protection Act 24 of 1935.

The Sea Birds and Seals Protection Act 46 of 1973.

The Societies for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act 169 of 1993.

Indian Statutes

The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act 59 of 1960.

The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (Slaughter House) Rules 2001.

The Prevention of Cruelty to Draught and Pack Animals Rules 1968.

The Transport of Animals Rules 1978.

The Wild Life (Protection) Amendment Act 16 of 2003.

Kenyan Statutes

Animal Diseases Act Chapter 364 *of the Laws of Kenya*.

Cattle Cleansing Act Chapter 358 *of the Laws of Kenya*.

Environment Management and Coordination Act 8 of 1999 *of the Laws of Kenya*.

Meat Control Act Chapter 356 *of the Laws of Kenya*.

Rabies Act Chapter 365 *of the Laws of Kenya*.

The Fisheries Act Chapter 378 *of the Laws of Kenya*.

The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act Chapter 360 *of the Laws of Kenya*.

The Wildlife (Conservation and Management) Act 1 of 1976 *of the Laws of Kenya*.

Swiss Statutes

Federal Constitution of the Swiss Confederation 1999.

Swiss Animal Protection Ordinance 1981.

Swiss Federal Act on Animal Protection of March 9, 1978.

United States of America Statutes

Adoption of Military Working Dogs 10 USC 2582.

Animal Health Protection Act 7 USC 8301 – 8321.

Animal Welfare Act 7 USC 2131 – 2159.

Bald and Golden Eagle Protection Act 16 USC 668 – 668d.

Department of Defence Appropriation Acts.

Depictions of Animal Cruelty 18 USC 48.

Disposition of Unfit Horses and Mules 40 USC 311b.

Dog and Cat Protection Act 19 USC 1308.

Endangered Species Act 16 USC 1531-1544.

Federal Law Enforcement Animal Protection Act 18 USC 1368.

Federal Pet Protection Act 7 USC 2158.

Horse Protection Act 15 USC 1821 – 1831.

Humane Slaughter Act 7 USC 1901 – 1906.

Lacy Act 18 USC 41 – 48.

Lacy Act Amendments 16 USC 3371 – 3378.

Marine Mammal Protection Act 16 USC 1361 – 1421h.

Pets Evacuation and Transportation Standards Act 42 USC 5170(a) (3) (J), 5196(e) (4), 5196(j) (2), 5196(g).

Public Health Act 42 USC 283e.

Shipping Code 46 USC 3901 – 3902.

Twenty – Eight Hour Law 49 USC 80502.

Whaling Conservation Act 16 USC 916 – 9161.

Wild Bird Conservation Act 16 USC 4901 – 4916.

Wild Free – Roaming Horses and Burros Act 16 USC 1331 – 1340.

Table of Contents

Declaration	Page i
Abstract	Page ii-iii
Acknowledgement	Page iv
List of Abbreviations	Page v-vi
Table of Cases	Page vii
Table of Statutes	Page viii-x
Table of Contents	Page xi-xvi
Main Thesis	Page 1-169
Bibliography	Page 170-178
Annexures	Page 179-185
Chapter 1 – Introduction	Page 1-13
1.1 Introduction	Page 1
1.2 South Africa	Page 5
1.3 Foreign Jurisdiction	Page 6
1.4 Objectives of the Study	Page 7
1.5 Definitions	Page 7
1.6 Literature Review	Page 9
1.7 Significance of the Study	Page 11
1.8 Research Question	Page 11
1.9 Hypothesis of the Study	Page 12
1.10 Research Methodology	Page 12
1.11 Outline of Chapters	Page 12

Chapter 2 - Brief History of the Animal Rights/Welfare Movement Page 14-27

2.1 3000BC – 1000AD.....	Page 15
2.1.1 <i>The Romans</i>	Page 15
2.1.2 <i>India</i>	Page 17
2.2 1000AD – 1500AD.....	Page 18
2.3 1501AD – 1700AD	Page 20
2.4 1701AD – 1900AD... ..	Page 21
2.5 1901AD – Present Day	Page 25

Chapter 3 - Discussion of Selected Animal Related Issues Page 28-45

3.1 Natural vs Legal Rights	Page 28
3.2 Various ways that animals are used and abused	Page 29
3.2.1 <i>Animals as food</i>	Page 30
3.2.2 <i>Animals as clothing</i>	Page 30
3.2.3 <i>Animals as entertainment</i>	Page 30
3.2.4 <i>Animals as transport</i>	Page 30
3.2.5 <i>Animals used in experiments</i>	Page 31
3.2.6 <i>Animals and religious practices</i>	Page 31
3.2.7 <i>Companion Animals</i>	Page 32
3.2.8 <i>Hunting and Animals</i>	Page 32
3.2.9 <i>Trading in Animals</i>	Page 32
3.3 Animal Welfare vs Animal Rights	Page 33
3.3.1 <i>Animal Welfare Movement</i>	Page 33
3.3.2 <i>Animal Rights Lobby</i>	Page 34
3.4 Animal Rights Approaches	Page 39
3.4.1 <i>Peter Singer</i>	Page 39

3.4.2 <i>Tom Regan</i>	Page 40
3.4.3 <i>Steven Wise</i>	Page 41
3.4.4. <i>Gary Francione</i>	Page 42
3.4.5. <i>Bernard Rollin</i>	Page 43
3.5 Why not give rights to the environment and not just animals?	Page 44
Chapter 4 – International and Regional Law	Page 46-67
4.1 International Treaties	Page 48
4.1.1 <i>Universal Declaration on Animal Welfare</i>	Page 48
4.1.2 <i>The Convention on Biological Diversity of 1992</i>	Page 50
4.1.3 <i>The Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Fauna and Flora</i>	Page 51
4.2 The United Nations	Page 52
4.2.1 <i>The Food and Agricultural Organisation (FAO)</i>	Page 53
4.2.2 <i>The International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA)</i>	Page 54
4.2.3 <i>The World Trade Organisation (WTO)</i>	Page 55
4.3 United Nations Environment Programme	Page 56
4.4 Regional Agreements	Page 57
4.4.1 <i>The Americas</i>	Page 57
4.4.1.1 <i>The Organisation of American States</i>	Page 57
4.4.2 <i>Africa</i>	Page 58
4.4.2.1 <i>African Union</i>	Page 59
4.4.3 <i>Europe</i>	Page 61
4.4.3.1 <i>The European Union</i>	Page 61
4.4.3.2 <i>The Council of Europe</i>	Page 63
4.4.4 <i>Asia and Pacific Regions</i>	Page 66

4.4.4.1 <i>The Association of Southeast Asian Nations</i>	Page 67
Chapter 5 – Legal Protection of Animals in Four Foreign Jurisdictions	Page 68-112
5.1 United States of America	Page 69
5.1.1 <i>The Animal Welfare Act of 2007</i>	Page 71
5.1.2 <i>The Humane Methods of Slaughter Act of 1978</i>	Page 72
5.1.3 <i>Twenty –Eight Hour Law of 1994</i>	Page 74
5.1.4 <i>Other Major Federal Statutes</i>	Page 75
5.1.5 <i>A Note on State Laws</i>	Page 76
5.2 India	Page 78
5.2.1 <i>The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act of 1960</i>	Page 79
5.2.2 <i>The Wild Life (Protection) Act of 1972 and the Wild Life (Protection) Amendment Act of 2002</i>	Page 83
5.2.3 <i>Rules</i>	Page 84
5.3 Switzerland	Page 87
5.3.1 <i>The Swiss Federal Act on Animal Protection of 1978</i>	Page 88
5.3.2 <i>The Swiss Animal Protection Ordinance of 1981</i>	Page 91
5.4 Kenya	Page 98
5.4.1 <i>The Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act of 1962</i>	Page 98
5.4.2 <i>Draft Wildlife Policy of 2007</i>	Page 101
5.4.3 <i>Other Current Animal Welfare Legislation</i>	Page 108
Chapter 6 – South Africa	Page 113-146
6.1 South African Government Departments Responsible For Animal Welfare	Page 113
6.1.1 <i>The Department of Agriculture</i>	Page 114
6.1.2 <i>The Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism</i>	Page 116

6.2 Laws Regulating Animal Welfare	Page 117
6.2.1 <i>The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa</i>	Page 117
6.2.2 <i>The Animal Protection Act 71 of 1962</i>	Page 118
6.2.3 <i>Performing Animals Protection Act of 1935</i>	Page 123
6.2.4 <i>The Societies for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Act of 1993</i>	Page 124
6.2.4.1 <i>The National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (NSPCA)</i>	Page 128
6.3 Other Animal Welfare Legislation	Page 129
6.4 Provincial Legislation	Page 132
6.5 Industry Codes/Rules	Page 138
6.6 The Care and Use of Animals for Scientific Purposes	Page 142
6.7 Animal Related By-Laws	Page 143
Chapter 7 – Proposals for Future Development in South Africa	Page 147-163
7.1 Legislative Suggestions	Page 147
7.1.1 <i>Legislation concerning domestic and wild animals</i>	Page 147
7.1.2 <i>Legislation concerning scientific research</i>	Page 154
7.1.3 <i>Legislation concerning farm animals</i>	Page 155
7.2 Education Suggestions	Page 157
7.3 Suggestions for Current Lifestyle Practices	Page 160
7.4 Role of the Media	Page 161
Chapter 8 – Conclusion	Page 164-168
Bibliography	Page 169-178
Annexure A – <i>An Act against Plowing by the Tayle, and pulling the Wooll off living Sheep</i>	Page 179
Annexure B – <i>Massachusetts Body of Liberties of 1641</i>	Page 181

Annexure C – *Extracts from The Speech by Lord Erskine ... on the Bill for Preventing Malicious and Wanton Cruelty to Animals (1809)* Page 182

Annexure D – *An Act to Prevent the Cruel and Improper Treatment of Cattle. 22nd July, 1822* Page 183